ENAR, the voice of the anti-racist movement in 27 EU member states

This report is funded by the European Commission,
DG Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities.
Racism and discrimination continue to be very serious manifestations of the failure of European societies to protect the fundamental rights of ethnic and religious minority communities. Discrimination manifests itself across a range of areas, including employment, education, health, housing, access to goods and services and racist crime and violence. The experience of Roma and migrant communities and instances of Islamophobia and anti-Semitism across Europe provide some of the most serious expressions of these problems.

2008 was a key year for anti-racism, marked in particular by the European Commission’s long awaited proposal for a Directive on equal treatment prohibiting discrimination on grounds of age, disability, sexual orientation and religion or belief outside employment. ENAR has long advocated for closing the gaps in legal protection against discrimination and actively engaged in a campaign to ensure the proposal would be put forward. This proposal, if adopted, will be crucial in guaranteeing all people enjoy the same rights in all areas of life.

2008 was also marked by several manifestations of anti-Gypsism in different EU member states. Incidents such as those which happened in Italy, Hungary and the Czech Republic against the Roma population cannot be tolerated. However, these are not isolated examples; they are a warning of what will happen if we do not remain vigilant to the dangers of racism in Europe. At the same time the EU was very active in putting Roma inclusion high on its agenda, a process to which ENAR contributed actively, notably as a member of the newly established European Roma Policy Coalition.

Another key ENAR priority was to ensure that the busy EU agenda in the field of migration policy does not undermine the fundamental rights of third country nationals and is founded on a human rights based approach. A central event in this respect was ENAR’s policy seminar on “Framing a positive approach to migration”.

As to the network itself, ENAR celebrated its tenth anniversary this year, an opportunity to look back with pride on its achievements over the last ten years, not least its ongoing drive to organise the anti-racist NGO community and become a vibrant advocate of civil society in the fight against racism, discrimination and xenophobia.

I would like to warmly thank the various stakeholders of the network for making the work of ENAR possible. First in line are our members, the raison d’être of ENAR, but also the ENAR Secretariat for their drive, dedication and hard work. The European Commission, the Compagnia di San Paolo and the Open Society Institute were also crucial in providing valuable support to the network’s activities. Gratitude also goes out to our Chairman Mohammed Aziz and Bureau members for their commitment and energy in enabling ENAR to be an active voice of the anti-racist movement in Europe.

Pascale Charhon
ENAR Director

“A ethnic minorities are an integral part of our society. Europe is, furthermore, the continent of ethnic and cultural diversity. In this European Year of Intercultural Dialogue, working to develop an inclusive society which guarantees equal opportunities for all (...) means not only achieving the fundamental values of the European Union but also putting in place one of the necessary conditions for sustainable growth.”

Vladimir Špidla, EU Commissioner for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities, 9 September 2008
Introduction

The work of NGOs at European level is essential in articulating and defending the views of civil society from the grassroots through to the regional and European levels. The voice of civil society must not only be heard, but integrated into European legislation to ensure positive change in the day-to-day lives of those affected by racism and other forms of discrimination.

ENAR was established as a result of the 1997 European Year Against Racism and is a network of NGOs working to combat racism in all EU member states. The network’s objectives are to fight racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, to promote equal treatment for all and to link local and national actions with European initiatives. By reflecting local and national priorities, ENAR strives to ensure that developments at the European level further the fight against racism in all member states and make a real difference to the lives of those who experience racism.

During 2008 ENAR continued to engage in a variety of activities aiming to achieve its strategic objectives. ENAR’s work to ensure a new directive to prohibit discrimination outside employment was proposed was particularly important, as was its work in the field of social inclusion of ethnic and religious minorities, and in particular the Roma minority. ENAR also continued to advocate for the development of progressive migration and integration policies which respect the fundamental rights of all third country nationals. Developing ENAR’s General Policy Paper on education was another important area of work. ENAR also took an active part in the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue, through its involvement in the Platform for Intercultural Europe.

ENAR strengthened its relations with EU institutions and key stakeholders, in particular by striving to establish structured relationships with the EU presidencies and playing an active role in the activities of the European Parliament Intergroup on Anti-Racism and Diversity.

As to the network itself, an important highlight of 2008 was ENAR’s 10th anniversary and the celebration events that took place around this key moment. ENAR also continued to invest in capacity building for its members and to improve its communication tools.

Main developments at EU level

Equality and non-discrimination

2008 was a busy year for the European Union in terms of equality and non-discrimination. Drawing on the successful implementation of the 2005 Framework Strategy against Discrimination and the 2007 European Year of Equal Opportunities for All, the Commission adopted under its renewed social agenda on 2 July a non-discrimination package which included a proposal for a new Directive implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation, aiming to close the gaps in legal protection and to ensure all people in Europe are equally protected from discrimination. The package also comprised a Communication presenting a comprehensive approach to step up action against discrimination and promote equal opportunities.

EU member states continued to implement the EU equality directives, although there were a number of countries in which the transposition into national law was problematic. Indeed, the European Commission sent formal notices to 11 member states in January for failing to transpose the employment equality Directive.

The European Commission also commissioned a survey tracking how perceptions and opinion in the field of anti-discrimination have changed following the 2007 European Year of Equal Opportunities. The findings provide an insight into the perceptions, attitudes, knowledge and awareness of discrimination and inequality in the European Union.

An important event in 2008 in this field was the second European Equality Summit which took place in Paris in September.

“...only by fighting for comprehensive protection against all grounds of discrimination that we will achieve equal opportunities for all in jobs, accommodation, schools.”

ENAR opinion piece, 21 March 2008
Equality ministers and stakeholders were able to give their views on the European Commission’s proposal for a new equality directive and to follow up on the commitments made by EU countries as part of the 2007 European Year of Equal Opportunities for All.

Social inclusion and the EU’s renewed Social Agenda

The “Renewed Social Agenda” was proposed in July in order to help review existing EU policy tools to achieve the objectives of the EU treaty. It is built around three main pillars: creating opportunities; providing access, which includes actions such as equal access to education, social protection and health care; and demonstrating solidarity, which includes actions such as fostering social inclusion and combating poverty.

A key development in the area of social inclusion was the publication, as part of the social package published in July, of a Communication entitled “A renewed commitment to social Europe: Reinforcing the Open Method of Coordination for Social Protection and Social Inclusion”. This communication proposes a revision of the EU’s system for coordinating national policies to tackle poverty and guarantee social protection. In addition, the 7th Round Table on Poverty and Social Exclusion, jointly organised by the European Commission and the French Presidency in October, focused on active inclusion strategies for people furthest from the labour market. Finally, the Council of EU Employment ministers adopted the European Commission’s proposal to designate 2010 to the European Year against Poverty and Social Exclusion in October.

Roma inclusion

The inclusion of the Roma community was high on the agenda of the EU in 2008, especially against the backdrop of anti-Roma violence in several member states including Italy, Hungary and the Czech Republic. The European Parliament adopted a Resolution on a Roma Strategy in January in which it urged the European Commission to adopt a European Framework Strategy and a Community action plan on the Roma. In July, the Commission issued a working paper on Community instruments and policies for Roma inclusion. Furthermore, the December European Council adopted conclusions on Roma inclusion, calling upon the Commission and the member states to take account of the situation of the Roma when designing and implementing policies to defend fundamental rights, combat poverty and discrimination and calling on the European Commission to establish an integrated European Platform on Roma inclusion.

In addition a high-level EU Roma Summit was organised on 16 September to promote a joint commitment by national, European and civil society representatives to tackle the widespread discrimination and exclusion faced by millions of Europeans of Roma origin.

Migration and integration

A number of proposals were on the table of the EU institutions in the area of migration. The proposal for a Directive providing for sanctions against employers of “illegally staying” third country nationals was discussed in the European Parliament and the Council of Ministers. The proposals for a Directive establishing a common set of rights for third-country workers legally residing in a member state and for a Directive “The European Union must adopt a comprehensive and ambitious approach to the Roma that will secure real change in the lives of the ten million Roma in Europe.”

ENAR press release, 19 November 2008
on the conditions of entry and residence of third-country nationals for the purposes of highly qualified employment, the so-called "blue card" Directive, were also both discussed in the European Parliament. In addition, the European Commission issued a Green Paper on "Migration and mobility: challenges and opportunities for EU education systems" to open the debate on how education policies may better address the challenges posed by the presence in schools of large numbers of children from a migrant background.

The European Commission also issued a Communication on a Common Immigration Policy for Europe in June, setting out 10 common principles under three main strands: prosperity and immigration, solidarity and immigration, and security and immigration. In parallel, the French Presidency developed a proposal for a European Pact on Migration and Asylum which was adopted during the October European Council.

In relation to integration, the 3rd European Ministerial Conference on Integration took place under the French Presidency of the EU in November. Integration Ministers agreed to give particular attention to several themes when defining and implementing their national integration policies, including promotion of the European Union’s fundamental values, access to employment and the promotion of diversity, the integration of women, the education of children, and intercultural dialogue. Preparatory work on establishing a "European Integration Forum" which would bring together a range of actors was also undertaken in 2008. With regard to family reunification, the European Commission published a Communication on the application of the Directive on the right to family reunification, which analyses the transposition of the Directive and announces the intention to bring forward a Green Paper on family reunification for third country nationals.

In relation to integration, the 3rd European Ministerial Conference on Integration took place under the French Presidency of the EU in November. Integration Ministers agreed to give particular attention to several themes when defining and implementing their national integration policies, including promotion of the European Union’s fundamental values, access to employment and the promotion of diversity, the integration of women, the education of children, and intercultural dialogue. Preparatory work on establishing a "European Integration Forum" which would bring together a range of actors was also undertaken in 2008. With regard to family reunification, the European Commission published a Communication on the application of the Directive on the right to family reunification, which analyses the transposition of the Directive and announces the intention to bring forward a Green Paper on family reunification for third country nationals.

In relation to integration, the 3rd European Ministerial Conference on Integration took place under the French Presidency of the EU in November. Integration Ministers agreed to give particular attention to several themes when defining and implementing their national integration policies, including promotion of the European Union’s fundamental values, access to employment and the promotion of diversity, the integration of women, the education of children, and intercultural dialogue. Preparatory work on establishing a "European Integration Forum" which would bring together a range of actors was also undertaken in 2008. With regard to family reunification, the European Commission published a Communication on the application of the Directive on the right to family reunification, which analyses the transposition of the Directive and announces the intention to bring forward a Green Paper on family reunification for third country nationals.

In relation to integration, the 3rd European Ministerial Conference on Integration took place under the French Presidency of the EU in November. Integration Ministers agreed to give particular attention to several themes when defining and implementing their national integration policies, including promotion of the European Union’s fundamental values, access to employment and the promotion of diversity, the integration of women, the education of children, and intercultural dialogue. Preparatory work on establishing a "European Integration Forum" which would bring together a range of actors was also undertaken in 2008. With regard to family reunification, the European Commission published a Communication on the application of the Directive on the right to family reunification, which analyses the transposition of the Directive and announces the intention to bring forward a Green Paper on family reunification for third country nationals.

2008 European Year of Intercultural dialogue
2008 was designated European Year of Intercultural Dialogue in order to recognise that Europe’s great cultural diversity represents a unique advantage. It aimed to encourage all those living in Europe to explore the benefits of our rich cultural heritage and opportunities to learn from different cultural traditions.

The Year focused on eight major topics related to intercultural dialogue: culture and the media, education, migration, minorities, multilingualism, religion, the workplace, and youth.

The Year featured a small number of flagship projects on a European level, as well as EU support for a national project in each member state. Well-known ambassadors were also appointed to raise awareness of the importance and benefits of intercultural dialogue. In addition, seven "Brussels debates", designed to provide a platform for reflection and exchange of ideas, were held throughout the Year, covering a range of intercultural dialogue issues.
ENAR highlights of 2008

Celebrating ENAR’s 10th anniversary

2008 coincided with ENAR’s 10th anniversary, an opportunity to celebrate the achievements of the network in the past ten years. ENAR can look back with pride on its achievements over the last years, not least its ongoing drive to organise the anti-racist NGO community and become a vibrant advocate of civil society in the fight against racism, discrimination and xenophobia. On the occasion of this anniversary, ENAR organised a celebration event on 21 June which coincided with its General Assembly. The event took the form of a reception to which key stakeholders at EU level were invited, followed by a concert in a well-known Brussels venue, Le Botanique, featuring “intercultural” artists. ENAR also produced an anniversary leaflet giving an overview of the history and milestones of the European anti-racist movement over the last 10 years. The celebrations of ENAR’s 10th birthday were judged very successful by all parties involved.

Monitoring racism in Europe: ENAR shadow reports 2007, a civil society perspective

Towards the end of the year, ENAR launched its 2007 Shadow Reports on racism in Europe, which bring an NGO perspective on the situation of racism in Europe and represent a key monitoring and advocacy tool at both European and national levels. ENAR issued 25 national shadow reports, as well as a European Shadow Report drawing on the national reports and identifying trends concerning the phenomenon of racism in 2007. This year ENAR also published a special report on the situation of the Roma in Europa and two briefings presenting a summary of the key findings on the situation of the Roma and on the situation of employment as covered by the national shadow reports. ENAR organised a round table in the European Parliament entitled “The reality of racism and religious discrimination in Europe - The contribution of the ENAR Shadow Reports” to launch the European Shadow Report.

The reports identify communities vulnerable to racism and present an overview of manifestations of racism and discrimination in a range of areas, as well as an assessment of the legal and political context and responses by governments. The European Shadow Report concluded that manifestations of racism in Europe continue in key areas of life, despite some progress e.g. in the area of education and the media and that extremism and racist violence are on the rise. It also highlighted that racist political discourse is increasing in mainstream politics and that right-wing extremist semi-military groups are forming in Eastern Europe.
Campaigning for new anti-discrimination legislation

Following the Commission’s intention to put forward a new initiative in 2008 to combat discrimination outside the labour market, one of ENAR’s key priorities in 2008 was its campaign to ensure that a directive would actually be put on the table. The network was actively engaged in an advocacy and campaigning strategy targeted at the European Commissioners, the European Parliament and the EU member states in order to show the need for a single horizontal directive protecting all grounds beyond employment. Activities included a high-level meeting, as part of the Social Platform, with Commission President Barroso as well as a series of press statements and advocacy letters to EU stakeholders. The result was the publication on 2 July of a proposal for a Directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation.

Framing a positive approach to migration: ENAR seminar on the EU’s migration policy

ENAR’s policy seminar “Framing a positive approach to migration” in November was a key opportunity for stakeholders in this field to proactively define the frame of reference for the debate on an EU approach to migration. It considered the practical realities of EU migration policy, but also the less tangible “shape of the debate” that underlies the approach taken and leads to these practical realities. It concluded that the foundation for migration policies must be the human rights framework and formulated 15 principles for framing a positive approach to migration, urging for these principles to be followed and implemented in the EU’s future justice and home affairs programme.

Promoting Roma inclusion at EU level

2008 saw an increasing focus of the EU institutions on the social and economic inclusion of the Roma minority in Europe. In parallel, ENAR was strongly involved in fighting discrimination against this particular minority during 2008. The European Roma Policy Coalition, of which ENAR is a founding member, was launched in March with the aim of advocating for a Framework Strategy for a European Policy on Roma Inclusion. ENAR also actively participated in the EU high-level conference on Roma that took place in September and published a shadow report on the situation of the Roma building on the findings on the 2007 national shadow reports.

“Presenting the Roma as a threat to public security stigmatises an entire ethnic minority and goes against the very principles and values upon which the European Union is founded.”

ENAR press release, 19 May 2008
Policy developments

Combating discrimination and promoting the inclusion of ethnic and religious minorities

Ensuring adequate protection and legal redress for those experiencing racial and ethnic discrimination
ENAR very much focused on engaging in the debate related to the European Commission’s intention to propose a directive combating discrimination on grounds of religion or belief, disability, age and sexual orientation outside employment. The initial focus of the work was to provide technical and legal expertise on how best to “level up” protection on anti-discrimination across age, disability, sexual orientation and religion or belief. ENAR therefore organised an ad-hoc expert group on anti-discrimination in March which gathered legal experts on equality, anti-discrimination and human rights law from a wide variety of member states, as well as representatives from a range of European NGO networks working on equality issues. Drawing on significant legal expertise, the ad-hoc group sought to contribute to the ongoing technical work of bringing forward a new directive as well as to the public and political debate around its content. The expert group formalised a series of recommendations for future non-discrimination legislation and produced a report.

However, political developments meant that there was a need to rapidly develop an advocacy strategy to engage in the political side of the debate. Between March and June ENAR therefore engaged in an intense civil society mobilisation effort to increase pressure on the European Commission, the European Parliament and the EU member states concerning the need for a single horizontal directive protecting all grounds beyond employment. This translated in a series of activities including letters to and meetings with key stakeholders within the EU institutions, press releases, an opinion piece, and a specific issue of ENARgy devoted to the debate and issues informing the foreseeable directive. A broad range of ENAR members also campaigned at national level, sending press releases, letters of protest or emails to their national Commissioner or other relevant stakeholders (MEPs, Ministers). On 2 July, the European Commission published, as part of its “Social Agenda package”, a proposal for a new Directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation. This proposal aims to ensure all people in Europe are equally protected from discrimination and enjoy the same rights, regardless of age, religion or belief, sexual orientation and disability, in all areas of life. ENAR warmly welcomed the proposal as a vital step towards remedying gaps in current legal protection against discrimination. Since the date of its publication, ENAR is continuing its campaign to make sure the proposed directive is adopted as soon as possible and that some elements are reinforced in the directive, notably on education. ENAR also issued its preliminary position and proposed amendments on the directive.

ENAR also continued to monitor the implementation of the race equality and employment equality Directives at the national level and to support the European Commission in its demands for full compliance. Following the infringement procedure launched by the European Commission in January against 11 EU member states for failure to properly transpose the employment equality Directive, ENAR engaged in a series of activities encouraging its members to campaign at national level and put pressure on these member states. ENAR and its members also continued to monitor the national responses to the previous infringement procedures that the European Commission had initiated against 14 member states for their failure in correctly transposing the race equality Directive into their respective national laws.

“The lack of a comprehensive legal framework, covering all discrimination grounds in all areas of life, particularly education, contributes to the existence of discrimination in access to employment.”

ENAR press release, 29 September 2008
Institutional discrimination and positive action

ENAR has regularly drawn attention to the failure to mandate positive action in the EU equality directives. In particular in a context in which institutional racism fails to be addressed in a consistent manner, positive action can be a useful tool and concept to address these and other forms of discrimination.

In this context, and building on the policy seminar on positive action organised in 2007, ENAR started to engage the network in a series of national round tables aimed at promoting action, further debate and broader awareness raising in this area at national level. The ENAR network committed, as a result of the seminar, to organising nine national round tables between 2008 and 2010. These round tables aim to provide a forum for stakeholders to consider in a practical way the role of positive action as a human rights-based response to discrimination, inequality and disadvantage, analyse the national situation and explore ways to campaign at national level for implementing effective positive action policies, both in the private and public sectors. The first three round tables took place between October and December in Romania, Denmark and France.

In addition, ENAR used the results of its policy seminar on positive action to strengthen its advocacy and lobbying strategies on anti-discrimination, including in the discussions related to the new proposed directive on anti-discrimination. ENAR disseminated the printed report of the seminar to a wide range of stakeholders and policy makers. ENAR also organised a meeting of the European Parliament Anti-Racism and Diversity Intergroup on positive action in April, enabling a lively debate on the ethical rationale for positive action.

Finally, ENAR supported the European Commission’s research on positive action, in cooperation with the Bradford University research centre (UK), including dissemination of information and close collaboration with the researchers.

Lisbon Strategy & Social Agenda

In the context of the “social reality stocktaking” consultation exercise launched by the European Commission in 2007 to develop a diagnosis on Europe’s social situation, ENAR issued its response to the consultation on “Opportunities, access and solidarity: towards a new social vision for 21st century Europe”, calling on the EU to put non-discrimination, anti-racism and social inclusion at the heart of the new social agenda for 2010-2015 and to address the impediments that hinder ethnic minorities and migrants’ well-being. In addition, the network started reflecting on its input to the Commission’s Communication on the “Renewed Social Agenda”, issued on 2 July.

ENAR also submitted its response to the Commission’s second-stage consultation on the active inclusion of people furthest from the labour market, issued in October 2007. The network highlighted the need for active inclusion strategies to respond to the needs of all ethnic minority communities in a targeted manner, in particular in light of the additional barriers of discrimination and racism which they face in the labour market.

ENAR also produced a fact sheet aiming to inform ENAR members on the processes and strategies under the social dimension of the Lisbon Strategy.

Ensuring the social and economic inclusion of ethnic and religious minorities

The Open Method of Coordination (OMC) on social inclusion and the National Action Plans on social inclusion (NAPs) are core tools enabling civil society to ensure that poverty and exclusion experienced by ethnic and religious minorities and immigrants can be given specific attention. ENAR engaged with the OMC on social inclusion by creating a Steering Group on the National Action Plans on social inclusion, made up of a core group of six ENAR members from five countries (UK, Portugal, Malta, Cyprus and Lithuania), with the aim of developing the expertise of ENAR in this field. A Handbook on NGOs’ engagement with the NAPs was developed, including
ENAR also participated in the 7th annual European Round Table on Poverty and Social Exclusion in October and issued a public statement on this occasion, stressing the need to give a high priority to the visibility of ethnic and religious minorities in taking forward social inclusion policies.

In addition, ENAR produced a fact sheet aiming to inform its members on the content of the report of the EU high-level Advisory Group on the social integration of ethnic minorities and the outputs produced. ENAR also submitted policy recommendations on the report to the European Commission.

Roma inclusion
In March, the European Roma Policy Coalition, of which ENAR is a founding member, was launched with the participation of MEPs and Commissioner Vladimir Špidla. This coalition gathers NGOs working at EU level in the broader areas of human rights, anti-discrimination, anti-racism, social inclusion and Roma rights, and has developed a Framework Strategy for a European Policy on Roma Inclusion, which it is urging the EU to adopt. ENAR also actively participated in the EU high-level Roma summit that took place in September and, as part of the Coalition, produced a declaration in view of the summit. ENAR published a shadow report on the situation of the Roma building on the findings on the 2007 national shadow reports on racism and issued a number of press releases throughout the year expressing concern about the alarming situation of the Roma in Europe, also reacting to events in Italy in this respect.

Developing an effective response to racial violence and hate crime
Europe continues to experience problems of hate crimes and violence perpetrated against religious and ethnic minorities within the European Union. ENAR therefore produced a booklet aiming to address the issues that victims of violence face in all EU member states and to provide advocacy tools allowing ENAR members to lobby their national governments effectively on the implementation of the Framework Decision on racism and xenophobia and other European instruments on combating racial violence. The booklet is illustrated by testimonies of victims in the 27 EU member states and examples of best practices including legislative and non-legislative measures to counter racial violence.

ENAR also continued its advocacy efforts to ensure the formalisation of the adoption of the Framework Decision on combating racism and xenophobia, agreed upon in 2007, and the final lifting of all parliamentary reservations. ENAR therefore very much welcomed the formal adoption of the Framework Decision at the end of the year.

Raising awareness of the negative consequences of security measures and racial profiling
ENAR members continue to confirm the trends related to the existence of racial profiling in the work of the police in nearly all countries in Europe, based on police stereotypes which
might be described as associating ethnic and religious minority
groups with terrorism, drug dealing and irregular migration.
ENAR continued to engage in a strategic partnership with the
Open Society Justice Initiative on racial profiling and in partic-
ular worked with them on a European Parliament own initiative
report by MEP Baroness Sarah Ludford on this issue. ENAR also
devoted a specific issue of ENARgy to the issue of "policing and
ethnic & religious minorities".

In addition, following the adoption of ENAR's General Policy
Paper on Counter-Terrorism in 2007, a targeted dissemination
strategy was undertaken and the document was put forward in
a range of relevant policy discussions.

Promoting the development
of progressive migration policies

Promoting a positive approach to migration

In recent years the de-
bate on migration in
Europe has come to the
fore of public and policy
discourse. The EU has de-
veloped a broad agenda
in the field of migration
policy, but many recent
developments have the
potential to undermine
the rights of third country
nationals. ENAR therefore
continued to reiterate its
call on EU governments
and policy makers to ensure that the fundamental right to
equal treatment of third country nationals is respected. ENAR also
focused on the public discourse related to migration in
the European Union, addressing the ways by which a positive
narrative could be developed.

A key event in this context was ENAR's policy seminar on
"Framing a positive approach to migration" in November,
which enabled anti-racist civil society to proactively define
the frame of reference for the debate on an EU approach to
migration. The seminar argued that the foundation for mi-
gration policies must be the human rights framework and
that migrants' rights should not be dependent on the shifting
sands of public opinion.

Promoting a rights-based approach to migration and
asylum policy

The EU's 2008 agenda was dominated by debates around new
pieces of legislation putting into motion the EU's policy plan
on legal migration, including the proposals for a Directive est-
ablishing a common set of rights for third-country workers
legally residing in a member state and for the so-called "blue
card" Directive. ENAR issued a position and call for amend-
ments to the proposal for a Directive establishing a common
set of rights for third-country workers legally residing in a
member state, underlining that this proposal has the poten-
tial to make a significant contribution to the achievement of
a Europe free from racism but expressing concerns that some
of the provisions endanger the principle of equal treatment.
ENAR also published an ENARgy dedicated to migration.

Conclusions of ENAR policy seminar
"Framing a positive approach to
migration", 6-7 November 2008

A strategic partnership was also established with the Centre
for European Policy Studies (CEPS), a leading think tank in
Brussels, in the context of a seminar in December on "The
future of Justice and Home affairs: giving a voice to civil so-
ciety" which aimed to provide an opportunity for civil society
actors to exchange views with policy makers and academics
on the current development of European policy in the field of
immigration, borders and asylum.

Promoting progressive and comprehensive integration
strategies

Integration has emerged as a key area of activity for the
European Union in recent years. Many of the policy approaches to date have recognised that anti-racism and the fight against discrimination are an important element of an integration strategy. However ENAR believes that they have failed to recognise that anti-discrimination is both a prerequisite for, and modus operandi of, successful integration. ENAR continued to follow the emerging debate on integration and to pledge for policy coherence between the EU’s anti-discrimination, social inclusion and integration strategies.

ENAR participated and engaged in the debates related to the launch of a European Integration Forum and to the draft opinion produced by the European Economic and Social Committee on EU level promotion of policies to integrate third country nationals. A conference co-organised by the European Commission and the European Economic and Social committee took place in April during which ENAR acted as a rapporteur in one of the workshops.

During 2008, ENAR developed an innovative three-year project with the aim of enabling a migrant voice in the EU debate on integration. A project proposal was submitted to the Network of European Foundations under the title “Migrants, Rights and Integration Project: Practice to Policy”. The project, which was approved by the NEF, will be an integral part of ENAR’s work programme 2009-2011. It aims to bring best practices in migrant integration, identified by ENAR grassroots organisations representing migrants, to the European level and enable these practices to inform other countries’ approaches and, crucially, to inform the EU policy approach impacting on constructive integration policies nationally and locally.

ENAR also developed a partnership with the European Foundation for the Improvement of Living Conditions (Eurofound) in the framework of the CLIP (Cities for local integration policies for migrants) project. The focus of the CLIP project is on the social and economic integration of migrants and the role of local authorities in this process. This partnership involved ENAR’s participation in Eurofound events in November and December and Eurofound’s involvement in ENAR’s upcoming “Migrants, Rights and Integration Project: From Practice to Policy”.

Increasing the recognition of anti-racism in equality and fundamental rights strategies

Enhancing strategies to respond to multiple discrimination

ENAR was very active in the organisation of a joint seminar of the Anti-Racism and Diversity and the Gay and Lesbian Rights Intergroups which took place in October with the support of the European Green Party. It aimed to address the issue of multiple discrimination with the view to stress the necessity of bringing forward adequate protection in the framework of the new legislative proposal on anti-discrimination. ENAR also continued to mainstream multiple discrimination into its work, including joint campaigns with other anti-discrimination networks and the active consideration of policy issues from an inter-sectional perspective.

Mainstreaming equality and anti-discrimination

ENAR continued to promote the mainstreaming of anti-racism and equal treatment across European public policies and in particular in the field of education. ENAR adopted its 5th General Policy Paper on “Fighting racism and promoting equal rights in the field of education” in November. In order to drive and support the elimination of racial discrimination, promote inclusion and diversity in education and training systems, and enhance the educational attainment of ethnic minority and migrant pupils across Europe, ENAR proposes four key principles which should underpin all actions in the field of education and training. In addition, ENAR submitted a response to the European Commission’s Green Paper on migration and mobility, addressing the issues of raising the educa-
tional attainment of migrant and ethnic minority children in European schools and societies. ENAR also started engaging with the Lisbon Education and Training 2010 strategy and participated in a series of debates in this context.

2008 coincided with the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue, in which ENAR was actively involved through its participation in the Civil Society Platform for Intercultural Dialogue, renamed Platform for Intercultural Europe. The Platform developed a “Rainbow Paper” which sets out five steps to making interculturalism our new human norm and proposes five sets of recommendations. ENAR also published an issue of ENARgy focusing on the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue and beyond. Another highlight in the context of the Year was ENAR’s participation as content partner in the organisation of a “Brussels debate” on Intercultural Dialogue in the workplace by the European Commission.

ENAR also sought to involve its membership in the area of intercultural dialogue through cross-fertilisation of ENAR members’ best practices in this field. In this view, ENAR organised a training seminar entitled “Days of Dialogue, everywhere in Europe...” in May in order to present the concept and method of the Days of Dialogue already implemented in the Netherlands and Germany.

Keeping the focus on racism in fundamental rights policy
ENAR continued to monitor the implementation of the Hague Programme for freedom, security and justice in the EU in line with the particular concerns of the network. ENAR sought to ensure that the right to freedom from racial discrimination is enhanced through the EU’s fundamental rights structures, and by drawing on international human rights protections.

ENAR disseminated its 2007 General Policy Paper on counter terrorism to a series of stakeholders in the European Commission and the European Parliament. It also monitored EU developments in the area of counter terrorism and in particular the proposal to amend the EU Framework Decision on combating terrorism. In addition, ENAR responded to the European Commission’s consultation on the EU’s future in the area of Justice, Freedom and Security, based on the conclusions of its policy seminar on migration. Finally, ENAR engaged in the consultation on the Fundamental Rights Impact Assessment undertaken by the European Commission, which provided an important opportunity to advocate for effective tools to mainstream equality, anti-discrimination and human rights.

“ENAR is concerned that the European Immigration Pact’s primary focus on control of illegal immigration through a security and penal approach will seriously undermine its potential and instead places the EU in danger of undermining the fight against racism.”
ENAR press release, 10 July 2008
Relations with other stakeholders

**European Commission**
Throughout 2008, ENAR continued to build contacts with key stakeholders in the European Commission including Directorate General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities, Directorate General for Freedom, Security and Justice, and Directorate General for Education and Culture. One notable highlight was the partnership developed by ENAR with DG Education and Culture in the framework of the 2008 European Year of Intercultural Dialogue.

**European Parliament**
ENAR continued its commitment to the work of the European Parliament Anti-racism and Diversity Intergroup as secretariat of the Intergroup. Two events were organised by the Intergroup in 2008: a meeting on positive action in April and a joint Intergroup seminar with the Gay and Lesbian Rights Intergroup on multiple discrimination in October.

In addition, ENAR continued ongoing contacts with a number of MEPs on various issues on the European Parliament’s agenda, including the proposal for a new non-discrimination directive and various proposals relating to migration.

ENAR also started preparing its political engagement with the European Parliament in the context of the upcoming 2009 EP elections. Contacts were made with the Secretariats of a number of political groups to inform them about ENAR’s concerns at the time of drafting their campaigning manifestos. ENAR also produced a memorandum of ENAR’s priorities for the European Parliament elections.

“*The EU must take action to ensure coherent integration policies across the related policy areas and that integration really becomes a ‘two-way process’.*”

ENAR press release, 31 October 2008

**EU Council Presidencies**
ENAR continued to establish strong working relationships with the presidencies of the EU by organising high-level meetings and issuing a memorandum to each of the Slovenian and French presidencies.

ENAR met with the Slovenian presidency as part of its 27th Board meeting in April. ENAR was also particularly active with the French Presidency, organising preparatory meetings with the cabinets of the Ministries of Employment, Social affairs, Justice and European Affairs in April. In September an ENAR high-level delegation met with the French Secretary of State in charge of Solidarity Valérie Létard, with Cabinet members of Minister of Justice Rachida Dati, and Cabinet members of Minister in charge of Housing and Urban Affairs Christine Boutin.

An ENAR delegation participated in the second European Equality Summit which was organised by the French Presidency in September. ENAR also took part in the Fundamental Rights Conference organised by the French Presidency of the EU in December.
European Fundamental Rights Agency
ENAR continued to ensure a structured and productive relationship with the EU Fundamental Rights Agency, notably by taking part in the first meeting of the Fundamental Rights Platform in October, which gathered around 100 civil society representatives involved in fundamental rights. This meeting offered the opportunity to discuss the means of communication between the Platform participants to ensure an effective cooperation in the future. ENAR also responded to the consultations launched by the European Fundamental Rights Agency regarding its 2009 Work Programme and its 2008 Annual Report.

Other stakeholders
ENAR engaged with a range of stakeholders in relation to anti-racism and anti-discrimination. It participated in various meetings organised by the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and the Council of Europe. ENAR also participated in the preparatory meetings for the UN Durban review conference due to take place in 2009.

“The EU still has the opportunity to revisit its approach to immigration and asylum, framing it within a positive approach that combats racism and xenophobia and promotes the rights of all.”
ENAR press release, 15 October 2008
Enhancing the capacity of the network to deliver its mission

Throughout 2008 ENAR strove to enhance the skills, knowledge and capacity of the network. Communication methods between the Secretariat and ENAR members were strengthened and the level of communication has been increasing constantly on a broad range of issues.

Enlarging the network
A successful induction meeting took place in Croatia in December to start the process of setting up an ENAR national coordination in Croatia in the near future. In addition, ENAR started mapping anti-racist NGOs in Iceland in order to examine the possibilities of creating a national coordination there.

Capacity building
ENAR organised a training session on governance for newly elected Board members in April. Through workshops, non-formal education methods and lively discussions, new Board members were made aware of their individual and collective responsibilities - a good Board is effective as much by how it works together, as by what it discusses and the decisions it makes. The training also outlined the crucial role played by Board Members as a link between the Secretariat, the Bureau and their members.

In addition, ENAR produced a fact sheet on good governance which aims to inform ENAR members about the basic principles of sound governance to help them strive for their implementation at all levels of the network.

ENAR also held a training seminar entitled “Days of Dialogue, everywhere in Europe...” in May which aimed to introduce the idea and concept of the Days of Dialogue which take place in Germany and the Netherlands to ENAR members. The seminar gathered more than 25 mostly grassroots members from 22 EU member states. It was very successful and as a result, most of the participants are now envisaging ways to transfer this concept and practice in their own countries.

Further, over the year, the ENAR Secretariat has developed a fully fledged National Coordination Development Project. The final version of the project was adopted by the Board members in November. The project aims to increase the capacity of the national coordinations to play a key role in the development and implementation of the network’s advocacy and campaigning activities. It will be an opportunity for the national coordinations to work over a three to five year period and establish permanent human and financial resources that would enable them to plan and engage more effectively with ENAR’s work at national level. The first fundraising contacts with foundations active in the field as well as with the European Commission took place in December.
Communication

ENAR continued to improve its internal and external communication in order to ensure visibility of the network and promote its policy positions on EU developments in the field of anti-racism. ENAR is increasingly becoming the contact point on anti-racism issues for media and other interested stakeholders. ENAR staff met various groups of visitors and answered many questions on ENAR’s role.

Media relations
ENAR continued to develop its relations with the Brussels-based media and enlarge its media contacts database. In 2008, ENAR issued 29 press releases and statements on various issues ranging from the new proposed directive on non-discrimination to inclusion of the Roma community and the EU’s migration policy. ENAR received good media coverage on various issues, including on its 2007 Shadow Report on racism in Europe, the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue, the situation of the Roma community and the new proposed directive on non-discrimination. ENAR also contributed articles to various magazines and newsletters and responded to several radio interviews.

Communication tools
ENAR’s new website, launched at the beginning of the year, is now more user-friendly and dynamic and is attracting a growing number of visitors. It is being updated on a regular basis and the home page enables new information to be visible immediately.

ENAR produced four issues of its quarterly thematic newsletter ENARgy, which aims to provide an in-depth analysis of specific themes and act as a "policy forum". The editions focused on policing and ethnic & religious minorities; issues and challenges of the new EU equality legislation; the EU migration policy; and the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue.

ENAR’s weekly mail, published each week on the website, kept subscribers informed of the latest European news and developments related to anti-racism. It has proven to be a very widely read and useful tool for stakeholders.

Publications
ENAR published an anniversary leaflet giving an overview of the history and milestones of the European anti-racist movement over the last 10 years. ENAR also designed a special 10th anniversary banner as well as a logo to be used on all printed materials and documents until the end of the year.

ENAR also published a booklet aiming to address the issues that victims of violence face in all EU member states and to enhance the evidence base for the need for legal measures to combat racist crime and violence. The booklet is illustrated by testimonies of victims in the 27 EU member states. It also aims to provide tools for ENAR members to advocate for the adoption and implementation of measures to combat racist crime at the EU and national levels.

The ENAR 2007 Shadow Reports on racism in Europe, which included 25 country-specific reports and an EU-wide report identifying trends concerning the situation of racism in the EU during 2007, were also issued in 2008.

ENAR issued five fact sheets on various topical issues, including positive action, European law and equality, the EU high-level advisory group on the social inclusion of ethnic and religious minorities, the social dimension of the Lisbon strategy, and sound NGO governance.
ENAR organised three key events during 2008. One major highlight of the year was ENAR’s 10th anniversary celebration event in June. ENAR organised a reception with key stakeholders at EU level, followed by a lively and well-attended concert featuring musicians Mousta Largo and Benito Reyes & The People Talking.

In November, ENAR organised a policy seminar entitled “Framing a positive approach to migration”, which enabled participants to define the frame of reference for the debate on an EU approach to migration. The seminar concluded that the foundation for migration policies must be the human rights framework and formulated 15 principles for framing a positive approach to migration. ENAR printed a publication explaining these 15 Principles for framing a positive approach to migration which was widely disseminated to key stakeholders.

ENAR also organised a round table, hosted by the Anti-racism and Diversity Intergroup, to launch its 2007 Shadow Report on racism in Europe in the European Parliament in December. During a lively “Questions and Answers” debate, panellists and participants were invited to reflect on the need for data collection on ethnic and religious origin, and on the different roles of EU institutions, “watchdog” NGOs and wider civil society in demonstrating and documenting the reality of racism and religious discrimination in the EU and its member states.

“It is a reality that employment rates for ethnic minority groups and migrants are markedly lower than for the majority population and that discrimination and racism are key factors in the labour market exclusion of all ethnic minority communities.”

ENAR press release, 15 October 2008
Governance and staff

**ENAR’s decision making bodies**

ENAR held a series of statutory meetings in 2008. An important meeting for the network was the 7th General Assembly on 20 and 21 June during which Board members and substitutes adopted ENAR’s 2009 work programme and budget. In addition, the first meeting of ENAR’s Advisory Council of Eminent Persons took place just after the General Assembly, during which an exchange of views took place with the members of the General Assembly on the potential future activities of the Advisory council. The Council gathered as key first members the former chair of ENAR Bashy Quraishy, the former Vice-Chair Tarafa Baghajati and the former Treasurer Simone Wiegratz.

In addition, ENAR organised two Board meetings, one in Ljubljana, Slovenia in November, and the other in Paris, France in November, as well as five bureau meetings, one meeting of the restructured fundraising, finances and staffing group, and one meeting of the policy and lobbying committee.

**Staff news**

The ENAR secretariat continued to engage in the day-to-day work of ENAR at European level and coordinate the fight against racism at European and national levels, thanks to a dedicated staff.

2007 saw some additions to ENAR’s staff. Katalin Halász, who previously worked at the Runnymede Trust in the United Kingdom, joined the ENAR team as second policy officer in February, and Celina Kin-Armbrust worked as assistant policy officer from July until October to provide support to the policy unit.
# Financial report

## January – December 2008

### Income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. PROGRESS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- European Commission</td>
<td>999,409.26 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Compagnia di San Paolo</td>
<td>62,000.00 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Open Society Institute</td>
<td>62,000.00 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Media Consulta</td>
<td>2,000.00   €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- National coordinations’ contributions</td>
<td>56,564.97 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Donations</td>
<td>4,812.28 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Miscellaneous</td>
<td>1,286.07 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total income</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,188,072.58 €</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Expenditure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>577,918.74 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel and accommodation</td>
<td>180,539.38 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>278,709.46 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>144,806.65 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other costs</td>
<td>1,264.33 €</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total expenses</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,183,238.56 €</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Balance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>4,834.02 €</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This financial statement was audited and approved by CdP Partners for the period January-December 2008 in March 2009 - full details upon request.

ENAR would like to thank the European Commission’s DG Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities for their financial commitment to the continuity of the network’s activities. ENAR would also like to express its gratitude to the Compagnia di San Paolo and the Open Society Institute (OSI) for their valuable support of ENAR activities in 2008.
ENAR’s governing bodies

Bureau
ENAR’s bureau is composed of seven members elected by the Board, which have the task of monitoring the managerial aspects of the network.

Chair:
Mr. Mohammed Aziz, United Kingdom

Vice-Chairs:
Ms. Clara Lopez de Letona, Spain
Dr. Chibo Onyeji, Austria

Treasurer:
Mr. Ali Qassim, Finland

Representative of the northern region:
Mr. Andreas Hieronymus, Germany

Representative of the southern region:
Ms. Andriana Mardaki, Greece

Representative of the eastern region:
Mr. William Ejalu, Hungary

ENAR General Assembly
ENAR’s General Assembly is the sovereign body of the organisation. It is responsible for managing the organisation in areas such as the definition of ENAR’s annual work programme and the approval of the budget. It is composed of two elected representatives (Board member and substitute) from each national coordination and meets once a year.

ENAR Board
The ENAR Management Board is responsible for directing the activities of ENAR. It focuses in particular on monitoring the implementation of the annual work programme and the tasks implied in the mandate of the organisation. It is composed of one elected member of each national coordination.

Who’s who in the ENAR Secretariat

Pascale Charhon
Director
pascalecharhon@enar-eu.org

Katalin Halász
Policy Officer
katalin@enar-eu.org

Celina Kin-Armbrust
Policy Assistant
celina@enar-eu.org

Georgina Siklossy
Communication and Press Officer
georgina@enar-eu.org

Michaël Privot
Senior Networking and Campaigns Officer
michael@enar-eu.org

Myriam De Feyter
Finance and Administration Manager
info@enar-eu.org

Juliana Wahlgren
Secretary
juliana@enar-eu.org