

FIRST ENAR AD HOC EXPERT GROUP ON PROMOTING EQUALITY IN EMPLOYMENT

Brussels, 26-27 November 2009

REPORT



european network against racism

The ENAR Ad Hoc Expert Group on Promoting Equality in Employment was organised in partnership with the European Economic and Social Committee (EESC), and with the support of the European Commission's Directorate General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities, ADECCO Group, IBM, L'OREAL and SODEXO.



Foreword



I am delighted to present the report of ENAR's first Ad Hoc Expert Group on Promoting Equality in Employment, which took place on 26 and 27 November 2009 in Brussels with the support of the European Economic and Social Committee. This Ad Hoc Expert Group, launched by ENAR working closely with ADECCO Group, IBM, L'OREAL and SODEXO, is a pioneering exercise in bringing together businesses committed to diversity and inclusion, trade unions, EU institutions, Member State governments and the anti-racist civil society to work collaboratively and engage in finding solutions to ensure the full participation of ethnic minorities in the labour market.

At a time when the economic crisis is hampering job creation and affecting the most vulnerable groups, measures in the EU to promote labour market inclusion are a key priority issue for ENAR, in particular in the context of the Europe 2020 strategy. Among the factors that hinder the participation of ethnic minorities in the labour market, racial discrimination continues to be perceived as the single most important structural integration barrier. Other significant integration barriers include linguistic, educational and institutional factors.

The Ad-hoc Expert Group meeting, therefore, sought to reflect in a proactive and positive manner on the responses that could be pursued by the different stakeholders in the field of employment to the structural problems of access to the labour market and equality in employment which ethnic minority communities experience in the EU.

This report of the meeting presents an overview of the discussions held and the preliminary research undertaken prior to the meeting, and puts forward a series of key recommendations to the EU institutions, Member States, the private sector and social partners, both in terms of policies and strategic partnership building. It also highlights a number of best practices undertaken by private companies, trade unions and governments in order to address the barriers that impede access and progression of ethnic minorities in the workplace, and to encourage partnership building across different stakeholders.

This meeting highlighted the value of a multiple stakeholder approach in identifying workable solutions that can positively contribute to the race equality agenda. We now hope that the proposed recommendations will be implemented by all stakeholders involved, in particular at EU level in the framework of the new European Employment Strategy which will be developed as part of the Europe 2020 strategy. In the meantime, we look forward to continuing the process of mutual learning between the different stakeholders in the framework of the Ad Hoc Expert Group.

Mohammed Aziz
ENAR Chair

Table of contents

Foreword	1
Table of contents	2
Introduction	3
Objectives and methodology	4
Part 1: The situation of ethnic minorities in the labour market	5
General state of play: background information & key inputs.	6
Challenges and barriers.....	8
General recommendations.....	10
Part 2: Responses towards equality in access to the labour market and progression & well-being in the workplace.	12
Access to the labour market.....	13
Summary of the introductory panel and plenary discussion.....	13
1. Tackling stereotypes, prejudice and negative attitudes, preventing discrimination in recruitment	14
2. Integration strategies, including supporting mobility and preventing the establishment of segregated neighbourhoods	16
3. Enhancing access to “quality jobs”.....	18
4. Addressing the lack of education and training, improving language skills and addressing the lack of recognition of skills and qualifications	20
Progression and well-being in the workplace	23
Summary of the introductory panel and plenary discussion.....	23
1. Tackling stereotypes, prejudice and negative attitudes in the public and private sector; the accommodation of diversity in the workplace.....	24
2. Enhancing progression and well-being of ethnic minorities in the workplace through equality plans and monitoring.....	26
3. Addressing the issues of quality of employment and precarious jobs. .	28
4. Addressing the lack of education and language skills.....	30
Part 3: Partnership building: Exploring methods of identifying common areas of concern and strengthening links between key stakeholders .	32
Conceptual introduction and summary of discussions	33
Key recommendations	35
Concluding remarks	36
Key recommendations	37
Annex 1: List of participants	40
Annex 2: Meeting programme	41

INTRODUCTION

to the ENAR Ad Hoc Expert Group on Promoting Equality in Employment

On 26-27 November 2009, ENAR convened a meeting of an Ad Hoc Expert Group on Promoting Equality in Employment. This gathered together experts on equality and diversity in the workplace, from the European institutions, Member States, as well as representatives from multinational companies, trade unions and NGOs. This report was informed by the discussions at that meeting. ENAR wishes to thank the participants for their constructive and valuable contributions in the meeting, as well as comments on a draft version of this report.



Objectives and methodology



Realising equality and diversity continues to be one of the key challenges facing labour markets within the EU Member States. The integration of migrants and ethnic and religious minorities in their respective host societies is determined to a large extent by their opportunities to actively participate in gainful employment.

In January 2006, under the leadership of Commissioner Vladimir Špidla, a High Level Advisory Group (HLAG) was set up to examine the integration of ethnic minorities in the labour market in the European Union. The advisory group, supported by IZA Research Report No. 16 - "Study on the Social and Labour Market integration of Ethnic Minorities", published in 2008, confirmed large and persistent patterns of structural discrimination and disadvantage affecting migrants as well as ethnic and religious minorities in the EU. At the end of 2007 the HLAG submitted a report and put forward policy recommendations in this regard.

The ENAR Ad Hoc Expert Group was set up with the aim of building on the momentum initiated by this high-level group, to reflect in a proactive and political way on the responses which could be brought by the different stakeholders in the field of employment, and on the structural problems of access to the labour market and equality in employment which ethnic minorities experience in the EU. On 26 and 27 November 2009, this pioneering initiative brought together four major multinational companies committed to diversity and inclusion (SODEXO, L'OREAL, IBM, ADECCO Group), trade unions (ETUC), EU institutions, national governments and the anti-racist civil society to work together by identifying ways forward in ensuring the full participation of ethnic minorities in the labour market. It also aimed to enable the sharing of best practices

and initiatives that have been undertaken by private companies, trade unions and governments. This timely gathering came as the EU began to reflect on its post-Lisbon strategy on growth and jobs and as stakeholders increasingly recognise the need for a holistic approach and joint actions to address the labour market inclusion of ethnic minorities.

The expert group had two main objectives:

- Proactively define the frame of reference of the debate on national and European employment and equality policies, and examine the responses enabling a better balance in the participation of ethnic minorities in the labour market.
- Study the role of all stakeholders in this process, including European institutions, social partners and civil society.

The recommendations of this working group are intended to:

- enable the European Union, Member States, social partners and NGOs to better engage with the policy issues and processes; and
- develop joint advocacy strategies on issues of employment and equality.

The methodology followed included a first phase of developing the research based aspects of the project, including a background paper, an agenda and critical questions for the Ad Hoc Expert Group to address. While the research was largely desk-based, the final part of the process involved a survey and a few short interviews with representatives of the different stakeholders involved in the expert group. The survey intended to test and refine the agenda, critical questions and approach to be taken for the Expert Group meeting. The second phase involved the facilitation of a one and a half day meeting of the Ad Hoc Expert Group to discuss and develop "standard setting" recommendations. Through a process of collaborative inquiry and powerful questions, the Expert Group identified workable solutions that can positively contribute to the race equality agenda. This report is the output from the event and the preliminary research, including the stakeholders' survey, with a series of recommendations for policy makers, corporations and other large employers, social partners and civil society.

PART 1

The situation of ethnic minorities in the labour market: key issues and challenges

The first session of the Ad Hoc Expert Group on promoting equality in employment aimed to give some background information on the situation of ethnic minorities in the labour market in Europe and to identify the key challenges hindering equal participation in the labour market for ethnic and religious minorities.



General state of play

General state of play: background information and key inputs from the Ad Hoc Expert Group

The situation of ethnic minorities can be assessed by measuring the rates of labour force participation, employment and unemployment. Other indicators include the level of segmentation of the occupations, levels of self-employment and of educational achievement. Income gaps and working conditions (including safety at work) also represent useful indicators. However, a major challenge is the insufficiency and inconsistency of the available European data on the situation of ethnic minorities in the labour market. To date, no reliable micro database has been produced to permit a cross-country European analysis. The collection and use of statistics on ethnic or national origin range from official encouragement to legal prohibition in EU Member States. Only a few Member States provide data which are broken down by ethnicity.

Jan Niessen, from the Migration Policy Group, was invited to the Ad Hoc Expert Group to present options and challenges for improving data collection and defining common indicators. He highlighted the need to mainstream the migrant/minority issue into the Lisbon strategy process and indicators in order to generate data on these groups. There is also a need to demonstrate more convincingly to EU Member States the value of data collection and developing indicators on migrants/ethnic minorities¹.

Nevertheless, despite the lack of comprehensive data on the situation of ethnic minorities in the labour market, there is evidence of gaps in employment rates and of differences in the quality of employment in the EU.

A report on the social and labour market integration of ethnic minorities described the labour market situation of ethnic minorities in Europe as “severe and worsening”. The Roma and Africans were most frequently cited as those facing the largest risk of exclusion². In addition, in many EU Member States the labour market situation is substantially worse for migrants than for those born in the EU. According to the European Commission, migrants “tend to

have lower employment rates and are often more likely to be unemployed, or are employed in jobs of lower quality of for which they are overqualified”³.

ENAR’s 2008 Shadow Report on racism in Europe concludes that ethnic minorities face discrimination at all levels in the field of employment, ranging from difficulties in the recognition of foreign qualifications to exploitation and abuse, including sexual and physical, in some cases. Minorities remain disproportionately affected by unemployment and employment under precarious and/or dangerous conditions. They tend to be employed in jobs that do not reflect their qualifications and to face a glass ceiling effect with regard to progression within the job.

Overall, southern European countries (new migration countries) tend to be more successful at getting migrants into employment, but with a greater risk of them being over-qualified and exposed to lower quality and precarious employment. On the other hand, northern European Member States (with a tradition of humanitarian or family related immigration) show a lower rate of migrant over-qualification but have greater gaps in participation and employment rates, and higher unemployment rates for third country nationals, compared with EU citizens⁴.

Access to employment

In most EU Member States, third country nationals and minority groups have a much lower labour force participation rate and employment rate, and a much higher unemployment rate than the majority population.⁵ For instance, Eurostat data on unemployment rates from 2006 shows a gap of 8.8 % to the detriment of non-EU nationals⁶. Where disaggregated data is available, the analysis of the participation rates and unemployment rates of ethnic minorities in the labour market provides evidence that membership of an ethnic minority can be a significant disadvantage⁷.

1 See also ENAR publication, The social and employment dimensions of the EU’s Lisbon strategy for growth and jobs. What are the opportunities for monitoring and improving the situation of migrants and ethnic minorities?, 2009.

2 IZA Research Report No. 16, Study on the Social and Labour Market integration of Ethnic Minorities, February 2008, p.6.

3 European Commission, Employment in Europe 2008, October 2008, p. 15.

4 European Commission, Employment in Europe 2008, October 2008, p. 15.

5 European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia, Migrants, Minorities and Employment: Exclusion, Discrimination and Anti-discrimination in 15 Member States of the EU, October 2003, p.5.

6 European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, Employment and working conditions of migrant workers, 2007, p. 18.

7 Report of the High Level Advisory Group of Experts on the Social Integration of Ethnic Minorities and their Full Participation in the Labour Market, Ethnic Minorities in the Labour Market. An Urgent Call for Better Social Inclusion, December 2007, p. 35.

The European Commission found that differences in skills can explain only a limited portion of the differences in employment rates between non-EU-born migrants and the EU-born across Member States⁸. The unemployment rates show that the situation of young foreigners is particularly critical. Women also face particular disadvantage and multiple discrimination, as well as migrants from predominantly Islamic countries, suffering from suspicion and “Islamophobia”.⁹

Quality of employment

Complaints relating to structural disadvantages affecting minorities in employment concern inter alia wages, payment of overtime, (oral) contracts, and ethnic harassment¹⁰. The European Commission’s 2008 Employment Report highlights that migrants tend to be more likely to have considerable job insecurity, with jobs of lower quality and precarious employment. They tend to “work more frequently at night or in the evening, are underrepresented in positions with supervisory responsibilities; work more often in low skilled sectors and occupations; are frequently involved in undeclared work; and have higher frequency of transitions between different labour statuses. Additionally, they encounter greater difficulties in achieving effective use of their human capital, often suffering from large job mismatches and working in jobs for which they are over-qualified”¹¹. Around 60% of high-skilled non-EU-born migrants in employment are in jobs for which they are overqualified, about three times the rate for the native born.¹² Moreover, the sectors and occupations where they are employed are characterised by less advantageous working conditions, including wages, career progression and training, and exposure to risk. Women with a migrant background are often restricted to certain segments of the labour market, such as personal and domestic services, cleaning, catering, health and care.

The situation of the Roma

The Roma community is the biggest minority in the EU, estimated at more than 10 million people. The available data and surveys show much higher rates of unemployment and significantly lower levels of income for the Roma than for the majority population or other disadvantaged ethnic minority groups¹³. José Manuel Fresno, independent expert on Roma issues in Spain, was invited to present the specificities of the situation of the Roma at the Ad Hoc Expert Group meeting. He underlined that the Roma face similar barriers as other ethnic minority groups but more intensively, due to a vicious circle of low education, low qualifications and labour market exclusion.

A fundamental issue affecting the Roma throughout Europe is their legal status, which differs from country to country. Even though a large number of Roma are nationals from EU countries, they often do not have any birth certificate or identity documents. A considerable part of the Roma population thus does not have any authorised legal status, which impacts on their basic socio-economic rights including education, health, living standards¹⁴ and on their employability.

The employability of Roma is low and many are excluded from work because of inter alia low or non-existent educational qualifications, work-based skills which are no longer relevant in a modern labour market, settlement in isolated areas with limited access to jobs and frequent evictions. However, discrimination is also an important factor, taking into account the dominant negative view of European citizens towards the Roma population, largely based on prejudices and stereotypes even more entrenched and negative than with other minorities. Direct but also indirect discrimination is facilitated by the fact that the Roma are visibly different from the majority population in many European countries where there are otherwise few people from “visible minorities”¹⁵.

8 European Commission, Employment in Europe 2008, October 2008, p. 100.

9 European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, Employment and working conditions of migrant workers, 2007, pp. 39-40.

10 European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia, Migrants, Minorities and Employment: Exclusion, Discrimination and Anti-discrimination in 15 Member States of the EU, October 2003, p.6.

11 European Commission, Employment in Europe 2008, October 2008, p. 15.

12 European Commission, Employment in Europe 2008, October 2008, p. 101.

13 European parliament, Policy Department Economic and Scientific Policy, The social situation of the Roma and their improved access to the labour market in the EU, October 2008, p. 22.

14 European parliament, Policy Department Economic and Scientific Policy, The social situation of the Roma and their improved access to the labour market in the EU, October 2008, p. ii.

15 Report of the High Level Advisory Group of Experts on the Social Integration of Ethnic Minorities and their Full Participation in the Labour Market, Ethnic Minorities in the Labour Market. An Urgent Call for Better Social Inclusion, December 2007, p. 45.

Challenges and barriers

Challenges and barriers

The analysis of the situation of ethnic minorities in the labour market has conducted several researchers to outline a number of challenges and barriers hindering equality in employment for ethnic minorities. Joachim Ott, from the European Commission's Directorate-General for Employment and Social Affairs, provided the Expert Group with an overview of these barriers, highlighting some of the main findings of the EU's High-level Advisory Group of Experts on the Social Integration of Ethnic Minorities and their Full Participation in the Labour Market¹⁶. The High-level Group concluded that barriers for disadvantaged people from the majority, ethnic minorities and immigrants are often identical and require similar responses and that membership of an ethnic minority is mostly a disadvantage per se. It identified 14 barriers hindering full participation of ethnic minorities in the labour market:

1. Lack of education and training
2. Lack of language skills
3. Lack of recognition of skills and qualifications
4. Lack of access to professions
5. Lack of access to citizenship
6. Lack of integration policies
7. Stereotypes, prejudices and negative attitudes
8. Lack of mobility and concentration in certain areas
9. Industrial change
10. Disincentives through welfare systems
11. Discrimination
12. Lack of information
13. Labour market competition
14. Undeclared work

Discrimination is perceived to be the single most important integration barrier, with public attitudes seen as a strong negative force for labour market integration¹⁷. Companies also describe discriminatory attitudes and behaviours as their biggest challenge in promoting diversity. They have to overcome opposition in the workplace.¹⁸ This trend is confirmed by the last Eurobarometer survey on discrimination in the EU.



Ethnic origin remains the most widely perceived ground for discrimination (61%) in the EU, and the majority of Europeans think that the economic crisis will lead to an increase in discrimination based on ethnic origin¹⁹. Discrimination can be direct, when a person is treated less favourably than another in a comparable situation because of their racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation. Indirect discrimination can also occur sometimes, when an apparently neutral provision, criterion or practice would disadvantage people on the grounds of racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation unless the practice can be objectively justified by a legitimate aim. Apparently objective criteria in employment could be, for instance, the possession of specific qualifications or a certain type of professional experience. Discrimination may also be due to the use of assessment guidelines which reflect the cultural assumptions of the majority population²⁰. "Institutional" or "structural" discrimination occurs when rules, norms, routines, patterns or attitudes and behaviour in institutions and other societal structures represent obstacles to certain people in achieving the same rights and opportunities that are available to the majority of the population.

Other significant integration barriers include linguistic, educational, internal and institutional factors. For instance, the International Labour Organisation noted that racial segregation in the area of housing may maintain labour market segregation by preserving recruitment practices through local networks that keep members of racial minorities away from decent jobs, regardless of their qualifications²¹.

¹⁶ Idem, pp.39-46.

¹⁷ IZA Research Report No. 16, Study on the Social and Labour Market integration of Ethnic Minorities, February 2008, p.6.

¹⁸ European Commission, The Business Case for Diversity, Good practices in the Workplace, 2005, p.6.

¹⁹ Special Eurobarometer 317, Discrimination in the EU in 2009.

²⁰ European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, Employment and working conditions of migrant workers, 2007, p. 40.

²¹ International Labour Organisation, Equality at work: Tackling the Challenges, 2007, p. 64.



Factors affecting new migrants' integration in the labour market of the EU include the "channel for entry, country of origin, host-country language proficiency, availability of support schemes at entry, labour market rigidities and access restrictions in the host country, incomplete recognition of qualifications acquired outside of the EU, lack of information on labour market functioning and discrimination".²²

Barriers preventing Roma from accessing the labour market include legal status, poor education and a high rate of illiteracy, dependence on social welfare benefits, as well as prejudice and discrimination in the labour market²³ and geographical isolation. In Hungary for instance, only 50% of Roma children were enrolled in primary school in 2003 and only 12.9 % completed secondary education. Moreover, about 60% of the Roma live in small settlements where the number of non-agricultural employers is limited.²⁴

For companies and SMEs, another big challenge is the lack of information and awareness of diversity issues and practices.²⁵

Finally, the impact of the immigration debate and the negative portrayal of migrants by politicians, policy-makers and the mass media - through stereotypical language and negative images - have led to a worrying increase in racism and xenophobia towards third country nationals irrespective of status and/or nationality. This climate is an additional chal-

lenge that third country nationals and ethnic minorities now have to face when seeking employment, particularly in light of the popular belief that "immigrants are taking our jobs". Additionally, the EU's utilitarian approach which focuses on the economic necessity of "highly skilled" migrants, as opposed to "unskilled" migrants, reflects the selective nature of current policies at EU level. This utilitarian approach and the focus on the fight against irregular migration have negative consequences on migrant populations who may not have the right qualifications and profile, or who may be suspected of being irregular migrants.²⁶

Public policies at EU and national level provide various responses to tackle the barriers faced by ethnic minorities in the labour market, ranging from employment and social policies to education and migrants' integration. The last speaker of this first session, Egbert Holthuis, Deputy Head of Unit on the European Employment Strategy at the European Commission, gave participants an overview of the functioning of the EU Lisbon Strategy for growth and jobs, its results and evaluation. He said one key objective for the Europe 2020 future strategy should be empowering people in inclusive societies.

During the discussion that followed, participants in the Ad Hoc Expert Group meeting agreed on recommendations to the EU institutions and Member States to better integrate ethnic minorities in the employment dimension of the Europe 2020 strategy, ensure better monitoring of their situation, and mainstream the objective of equality in all relevant policies.

²² European Commission, Employment in Europe 2008, October 2008, p. 15.

²³ European parliament, Policy Department Economic and Scientific Policy, The social situation of the Roma and their improved access to the labour market in the EU (IP/A/EMPL/FWC/2006-05/SC4), October 2008, p. iii.

²⁴ IZA Research Report No. 16, Study on the Social and Labour Market integration of Ethnic Minorities, February 2008, p.33.

²⁵ European Commission, The Business Case for Diversity, Good practices in the Workplace, 2005, p.7.

²⁶ See ENAR, 15 Principles for framing a positive approach to migration, Conclusions of an ENAR policy seminar on EU migration policy, 2009.

GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

1. Ensure the adoption of a future Europe 2020 strategy based on fundamental rights, with a strong social pillar that places employment and ethnic minorities at its heart:
 - Look into the specific barriers migrants and ethnic minorities face and develop strategies to overcome them in the future EU integrated guidelines on employment;
 - Convince Member States of the value of being fully involved in the Open Methods of Coordination (OMC)²⁷ and of using data collection, indicators and benchmarking;
 - Disaggregate relevant indicators on grounds relating to migration or ethnic background.
2. Use existing tools such as the LIME Assessment Framework²⁸ for assessing the economic impact of migration and integration policies. The LIME Assessment Framework has the potential to put migration and integration firmly on national and EU agendas as it demonstrates the importance of sound migration policies and the need for comprehensive efforts to increase labour market and educational outcomes for migrants.
3. Ensure that the objective of equality for ethnic and religious minorities is mainstreamed in all relevant EU policies, including in employment, health, housing and education. This requires integrating race equality into all Community policies and activities, and into every stage of policy processes - design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation - with a view to promoting equality between minority and majority populations. It means assessing how policies impact on the life and position of ethnic and religious minorities and taking responsibility to re-address them if necessary.
4. Implement and follow up the recommendations made by the High Level Advisory Group of Experts on the Social Integration of Ethnic Minorities and their Full Participation in the Labour Market set up by Commissioner for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities Mr. Špidla in 2007. In particular, address the specific 14 barriers to inclusion of members of ethnic minorities identified by the HLAG, and report on the practical actions taken in response to the different measures recommended.

²⁷ The OMC on social inclusion, on employment, and on education.

²⁸ The LIME Assessment Framework was developed by Directorate-General Economic and Financial Affairs working together with national authorities in the Economic Policy Committee's Lisbon Methodology Working Group (LIME), and in close collaboration with the Employment Committee. The LIME Assessment Framework (LAF) systematically compares GDP performance, both level and change, of all 27 EU Member States, and when available some OECD and candidate countries, across 20 policy areas affecting growth (of which migration and integration is one) relative to a benchmark.

Recommendations to Member States

5. Overcome Member States' reluctance to collect data on ethnicity by encouraging data collection on a strictly anonymous, voluntary and self-defining basis, in compliance with the rules on the protection of personal data, to bring more insight to diversity policies and management systems and increase the impact of good diversity practices.
6. Encourage Member States who collect similar data to engage in mutual learning exchanges and peer reviews. Establish a base line of data that could be used at EU level for further analysis.
7. Report on the progress of each specific minority group to the EU and set national targets for the participation of ethnic minorities in the labour market for Member States that collect disaggregated data.
8. Use the 2008 Labour Force Survey ad hoc module²⁹ as much as possible to examine the socio-economic outcomes of migrants and their descendents. Member States should also be encouraged to retain the questions used in this ad hoc module in their annual surveys.
9. Use the annual Labour Force Survey and the EU-SILC³⁰, which compiles comparable indicators on social cohesion for policy monitoring at EU level in the framework of the Open Method of Coordination, in monitoring the implementation of the Lisbon Strategy, to examine the situation of newcomers, long-term residents, naturalised migrants and the children of migrants. The idea of using the country of birth as a proxy for examining an ethnic, racial and religious background should also be further explored.

²⁹ The European Union Labour Force Survey (EU LFS) is a quarterly sample survey covering the population in private households that provides annual and quarterly results on labour participation of people aged 15 and over as well as persons outside the labour force. In addition, each year there is a different 11 ad hoc module that seeks to examine a particular subject area through the inclusion of an extra set of questions. The 2008 ad hoc module was on the labour market situation of migrants and their immediate descendants.

³⁰ The EU SILC collects cross-sectional data pertaining to a given time or a certain time period and longitudinal data pertaining to individual-level changes over time, observed periodically over, typically, a four year period.

PART 2

Responses towards equality in access to the labour market and progression & well-being in the workplace

Given the diversity of barriers preventing equal participation in the labour market for ethnic minorities and migrants, the policy responses can be varied, ranging from employment and social policies to education and migrants' integration. Public policies designed to combat inequalities can be effective only if they are pro-actively complemented by initiatives at the micro-level to enhance access to and progression in the workplace. The Ad Hoc Expert Group aimed to identify good practices at the macro and micro levels addressing the barriers that impede access and progression of ethnic minorities in the workplace.



Access to the labour market

Summary of the introductory panel and plenary discussion



Michael Hagos, from the Ministry for Integration and Gender Equality in Sweden, presented strategies to improve migrants' access to the labour market in Sweden. In Sweden municipalities are responsible for coordinating the introduction of new arrivals, and a number of good practices were highlighted. As a combined result of the previous years' high economic activity and the government's job-first policy, there has been remarkable improvement with regard to the labour market outcome among the foreign-born population as well as other marginalised groups. Many immigrants are today gainfully employed in the private and public sectors through the subsidy of payroll costs which has made it easier to employ as well as reduce the risk of unsuitable recruitment. The Swedish government intends to continue along this line.

Andor Urmos, Head of department of Roma integration in the Hungarian Ministry of Social Affairs, focused his presentation on strategies to improve the Roma's access to employment. Even though Hungary has been spending a lot on social policies, the results have been largely insufficient. There are no employment opportunities in the North East where the large majority of Roma lives. These regions are facing problems of ghettoisation and lack of infrastructures. Different programmes have been put in place, including vocational training, but with little impact on labour market inclusion. Overall, there has been a lack of sustainable inclusion policies. Asked whether the Hungarian government had experi-

ences of projects in partnership with companies, Urmos said cooperation with the private sector was essential. He mentioned the IBM project "Romaster" as a good practice. The programme supports socially disadvantaged and talented students of Roma origin who are motivated to pursue higher education studies in the fields of economics, engineering, IT or law. Beyond a monthly scholarship, the programme includes mentoring and the possibility to gain insights into the operations and culture of a company before graduation, therefore becoming well prepared for integration into the work environment. The mentoring programme and targeted approach were praised. Catelene Passchier, ETUC Confederal Secretary, called for a targeted strategy on Roma, following an in-depth analysis. However, specific policies targeting the Roma were not enough; continued efforts were needed to mainstream the needs of minorities in all policies.

Bruce Roch, Director of Corporate Social Responsibility for the Adecco Group in France, presented the business case for diversity and Adecco Group guidelines and standards for discrimination-free recruitment policies. He presented the compulsory trainings against discrimination of the group and the testings carried out in France. To the question of transferability of the business case, guidelines and standards to SMEs, Bruce Roch answered that SMEs were clients of Adecco group. Considerable explanation efforts were needed, using the legal argument and skills arguments of the business case for diversity. The aim was to convince SMEs of the added value of the skills harnessed by diversity. Agents of the Adecco Group are asked to refuse to serve clients if they perceive a risk of discrimination.

During this session, the Expert Group was divided into four workshops which aimed to provide a forum for discussion, debate and exchange of ideas and good practices concerning ethnic minority access to the labour market. The intention was to determine approaches to overcome barriers to access, to draw out good practices and lessons learned from different stakeholders that could have general applicability, and to establish a series of recommendations for action at macro and micro levels. The workshops covered four broad themes: 1) stereotypes and bias, 2) integration strategies, 3) quality of jobs, and 4) education and skills.

Access to the labour market

1. Tackling stereotypes, prejudice and negative attitudes, preventing discrimination in recruitment

At a time when the economic crisis is hampering job creation and affecting the most vulnerable groups, measures to promote labour market inclusion are one of the most prioritised issues in the EU. The Swedish Presidency of the EU organised a high-level conference on the issue in October 2009, with a view to preparing the new EU long-term strategy for 2020.



A recruitment method based on anonymous job applications was applied on a trial basis in the Swedish public sector. Some of the lessons learned were: anonymous applications gave equal chances to be called to interview for women and people with a foreign background; applicants had confidence in the method giving them a fair chance; and the selection process has become more skill-based and objective. In France Yazid Sabeg, High Commissioner for Diversity and Equal Opportunities, launched in October 2009 a survey testing the use of anonymous CVs to assess the presence of discriminatory recruitment practices, which is scheduled to run for six months. L'OREAL is taking part in this survey.

Among the issues that hinder the participation of ethnic minorities in the labour market, racial discrimination continues to be perceived as the single most important structural integration barrier. Companies also describe discriminatory attitudes and behaviours as their biggest challenge in promoting diversity in the workplace.



ADECCO Group participated in the EQUAL Latitude programme 2002-2006 and ongoing, providing a package of support and initiatives to recruiters on how to resist discriminatory requests for recruitment intermediaries and address discriminatory behaviour. The package includes training, legal guidelines and communication materials, as well as other tools. ADECCO also developed a Social Agreement against discrimination, a package of good equality practices and commitments, involving social partners under EQUAL Averroes 2005-2008 and ongoing.

In this context, public policy responses include inter alia anti-discrimination legislation, information and awareness raising, and socially responsible public procurement. Positive action measures can also help to encourage and boost initiatives to promote fair recruitment procedures. In general, the term “positive action” refers to strategies designed to counteract the effects of past discrimination and to ensure equal opportunities in practice. A number of interesting initiatives have been implemented in EU Member States, such as diversity charters and labels, anonymous CVs, outreach programmes and diversity training measures.



L'OREAL is seeking to measure the impact of manager recruitment since 2005. The methodology is the use of “first names” (a method recognised by the French National Commission for Data Protection and Liberties): two groups are formed, one with candidates having a first name of foreign origin considered to be in theory subject to discrimination (North African, Sub-Saharan African,..) and the other consisting of candidates (benchmark) with first names considered not to be subject to discrimination (according to the expertise of the Discrimination Observatory). The analysis compares the results of the first group with that of the second during two main phases of the recruitment process: interview granted or negative response after sending a resume, and accepting or refusing to hire.

During the discussion, the necessity of awareness raising about the skills brought by diversity and the importance of having role models was emphasised. The participants highlighted examples of good practices in tackling stereotypes, prejudice and negative attitudes to enhance access to employment at an organisational level, and debated on the priority areas for further development and possible solutions.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

10. Recognise the skills, attributes and aspirations of ethnic minorities living in the EU in the EU employment guidelines. Migrants and ethnic minorities residing in the EU are currently only viewed as a disadvantaged group. As a first step, recognise the importance of the contribution of ethnic entrepreneurs in Guideline 17 on achieving full employment.
11. Adopt the proposal for a Council Directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation³¹.

Recommendations to Member States

12. Urge Member States to make full use of the provisions of the transposed legislation on non-discrimination in the area of employment (EU Directive 2000/78) including the promotion of positive action mechanisms in recruitment policies.
13. Encourage the creation and implementation of positive action and positive duty measures.
14. Develop and systemise standards of recruitment free from discrimination that could be applied to the public and private sectors, and monitor implementation across different organisations.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

15. Encourage employers, their human resources personnel and trade union personnel from the private and public sectors to review their recruitment practices on a regular basis with a view to eliminating any indirect or structural discriminatory procedures or processes at all stages of recruitment.
16. Organise tailored training programmes and awareness raising activities for management and staff on non-discrimination, equality and diversity management.
17. Develop joint projects between various stakeholders (NGOs, trade unions and companies) in the area of diversity training.
18. Use top level managers as role models and champions of non-discriminatory and good diversity & inclusion practices.
19. Embed good equality, diversity and inclusion policies and practices into the strategy, operation and culture of the organisation.

³¹ European Commission, proposal for a Council Directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation, COM/2008/0426 final, 2 July 2008.

Access to the labour market

2. Integration strategies, including supporting mobility and preventing the establishment of segregated neighbourhoods

This workshop addressed the issue of geographical segregation and lack of mobility as an important barrier for ethnic minorities entering the labour market. Several FRA reports³² and the ILO study “Equality at work”³³ have confirmed that geographical isolation and housing segregation keep members of ethnic minorities away from decent jobs, regardless of their qualifications. This is particularly the case for the Roma community. In Hungary about 60% of the Roma live in small settlements where the number of non-agricultural employers is limited.



Hungary adopted in 2005 a plan entitled “Housing and social integration programme” to abolish residential segregation as a priority. It aimed to improve the social integration of Roma by implementing activities that not only improve housing conditions but also address educational disparities. At the same time, it improved employment possibilities and enhanced access to social services focusing on the social integration of disadvantaged people living in settlements throughout Hungary³⁴.

In general, the recognition of the challenges faced by segregated minorities and in particular the Roma minority is improving in EU Member States. Action taken or announced in the framework of the EU Strategy for Social Protection and Social Inclusion³⁵ mainly focused on desegregation, access to employment, addressing educational disadvantage and improved access to basic services such as housing and healthcare. However, in most Member States a comprehensive policy framework is still lacking.



In France, SODEXO and L'OREAL have both signed the “Plan Espoir Banlieues”. The Charter commits them to employment objectives, building awareness of their companies, jobs and professional fields, and to facilitate access to employment for individuals residing in disadvantaged neighbourhoods, many of whom are from ethnic minorities. SODEXO is also involved with the NGO “Les Restos du Coeur”, which primarily offers meals to people in need and works to reintegrate them into society, by providing training, internships and jobs to some of the beneficiaries.

During the discussion, participants in the workshop exchanged ideas and good practices concerning integration strategies, including supporting mobility and preventing the establishment of segregated neighbourhoods. Good practices and lessons learned from different stakeholders were drawn out, and a series of recommendations for action at macro and micro levels was established.



Other initiatives include the establishment of special incentives for job creation in disadvantaged neighbourhoods (for instance the “zones franches urbaines” in France), or the Ethnic Minority Outreach initiative, launched in 2002 by the UK government. The project, using a variety of outreach techniques (SMS, TV, radio, home visits, etc.) and the language skills of the operators, has managed to reach those who had never approached job centres, especially Indian and Pakistani women³⁶.

32 European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia, Migrants, minorities and housing: Exclusion, discrimination and anti-discrimination in 15 Member States of the European Union, 2006 and European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia EU Fundamental Rights Agency, Migrants, minorities and employment: Exclusion, discrimination and anti-discrimination in 15 Member States of the European Union, 2003.

33 International Labour Organisation, Equality at work: Tackling the Challenges, 2007, <http://www.ilo.org/declaration>.

34 Combating Roma Residential Segregation, Hungary, FRA, October 2009.

35 Council of the European Union, Joint Report of Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2009 (7503/09), 13 March 2009.

36 International Labour Organisation, Equality at work: Tackling the Challenges, 2007, <http://www.ilo.org/declaration>, p. 69.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

20. Invite every Member State to publish its integration strategy policy, and use this as a basis for peer review and mutual learning.
21. Invite every Member State to include migrants and ethnic minorities in their National Action Plans on Social Inclusion as a specific target group. This can include an explicit reminder of the Commission's strong views on the prioritisation of migrants and ethnic minorities in National Action Plans.

Recommendations to Member States

22. Establish channels of communication between policy makers and communities, and work with advocacy organisations representing ethnic minorities and migrants to enhance mobility and employability by improving access and quality of the overall urban and social environment, including housing and health services.
23. Create national and local services providing multilingual advice and practical support to migrants and ethnic minorities on a wide range of questions, such as employment, education and training, housing, residence, citizenship and social security (e.g. counselling for choice of settlement where there is demand for the skills that the new arrival has or intends to acquire).
24. Support the building of bridges between different communities and segregated areas to enable an exchange of experiences on how to improve employability.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

25. Encourage the adoption of agreements through which public and private sector employers are invited to make use of positive action measures in recruitment notably by attracting people from disadvantaged neighbourhoods.
26. Ensure that employers reach out to diverse neighbourhoods (e.g. through targeted career fairs, mentoring and work experience programmes).
27. Develop the potentially de-segregating role of Information and Communication Technologies in rural or segregated areas.

Access to the labour market

3. Enhancing access to “quality jobs”

The theme of this workshop was to explore the policy means and actions that are necessary to fight labour market segmentation and encourage “job quality”. The European Commission report³⁷ on Employment for 2008 has suggested a framework for the assessment of quality in employment based on four dimensions: socio-economic security (including levels and distribution of wages); education and training; working conditions (including work intensity); and reconciliation of working and non-working life/gender balance³⁸.

International labour standards promoted by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) have recognised that social protection, health and safety policies are essential to ensure that economic development and job creation go hand in hand with respect for workers’ rights and social justice. The debate on “decent work” relates to fair conditions and dignity for workers, occupational safety, and social dialogue. The ILO’s fundamental principles and rights at work consider equality and non-discrimination and social dialogue as the foundations for decent work.

The workshop participants discussed the definition of “quality jobs”. Satisfaction should not be a criterion to define quality jobs because some satisfied employees have been discriminated in terms of wages and are not aware of it. A quality job enables a person to work in good conditions, have a set of rights, a reasonable wage and foresee progression. It does not necessarily mean top jobs. The discussion then moved on to lessons learned from different stakeholders that could have general applicability, and to the establishment of a series of recommendations for action at macro and micro levels.



SODEXO Spain has participated in ACCEDER, a programme developed by the Fundación Secretariado Gitano to facilitate the integration process of the Roma population through the creation of labour opportunities such as training programmes. As part of this project SODEXO offered an 80 hour catering and cooking training course to members of the Roma community. These individuals gained new skills and a closer contact with the employment world. Some of them will complement their training with an internship as cooking assistants in one of SODEXO’s units, in the hope that they can then join the company permanently.

³⁷ European Commission, Employment in Europe 2008, October 2008.

³⁸ European Commission, Employment in Europe 2008, October 2008, p. 17.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

28. Integrate a strategy into the EU employment guidelines to prevent labour market segregation of ethnic minorities (currently migrants and ethnic minorities are not specifically targeted).
29. Provide funding for the implementation of diversity taskforces in the workplace, including training and awareness raising activities on non-discrimination, equality and diversity management.
30. Prioritise quality of work (including living wages, working conditions, job security, employment protection and reconciliation between private and professional life) as a core element of job creation, in line with the EU Integrated Guideline for Growth and Jobs No. 17 and the principles on flexicurity.
31. Adopt the proposed Framework Directive on the basic socio-economic rights of all third country workers³⁹.
32. Raise awareness on exploitation and its impact on migrants and ethnic minorities.

Recommendations to Member States

33. Ratify the United Nations Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, a vital tool to combat abuse and exploitation of migrants.
34. Encourage and support business start-up and entrepreneurship projects of members of ethnic minorities by providing access to market information opportunities and “niches” and to micro-finance schemes.
35. Use public procurement and corporate supplier policies to support ethnic minority businesses, and to encourage employers to implement high standards of diversity practices.
36. Encourage the promotion and use of positive duty measures as a catalyst for new initiatives to enhance access to quality jobs for migrants and ethnic minorities.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

37. Develop information networks to improve the dissemination of labour market information among migrants and ethnic minorities.
38. Develop mentoring programmes to facilitate contacts between employers and migrants and ethnic minorities seeking employment. These mentoring programmes, entailing one-to-one support, should involve employers, retired senior employees and members of trade unions, professional organisations and migrant and ethnic minorities associations.

³⁹ European Commission, proposal for a Council Directive on a single application procedure for a single permit for third country nationals to reside and work in the territory of a Member State and on a common set of rights for third country workers legally residing in a Member State, 2007.

Access to the labour market

4. Addressing the lack of education and training, improving language skills and addressing the lack of recognition of skills and qualifications

The EU's High Level Advisory Group on the social integration of ethnic minorities in the labour market has identified the lack of education and training as the most important barrier for ethnic minorities to access the labour market. These include the lack of language skills, but also professional skills and vocational qualifications⁴⁰. The lack of recognition of skills and qualifications is another difficulty. Under the principle of subsidiarity, Member States are in charge of their education and training systems but they cooperate within the EU framework of the OMC in order to achieve common goals, through mutual learning and the exchange of good practice. Gelu Calacean from the European Commission explained that cooperation between Member States started with regard to early school leaving, since the rates were significantly higher among migrants. The Commission's Green Paper "Migration and Mobility"⁴¹ focuses on early stages of education, since there is evidence that migrants are lagging behind nationals in school results. The most recent development in the field of education and migration was the adoption of specific actions points to which education ministers committed in November 2009⁴². Moreover, a new strategic framework for European cooperation in education and training was adopted by the Council of the EU in 2009⁴³. The agreed strategic common objectives are: making lifelong learning and mobility a reality; improving the quality and efficiency of education and training; promoting equity, social cohesion and active citizenship; and enhancing creativity and

innovation, including entrepreneurship, at all levels of education and training. In that framework, the achievement of migrants is a specific priority for the next three years.



Tower Hamlets Borough is a neighbourhood with a very diverse population. The council is committed to building a workforce to reflect the community of Tower Hamlets and helping residents of the borough to find jobs. The council also aims to attract employment to Tower Hamlets and works in partnership with other organisations to increase job and training opportunities for residents. An example of this commitment is the council's own graduate programmes and apprenticeship scheme. Both these schemes aim to provide young people with relevant work experience, industry recognised qualifications and the opportunity to advance their careers. The programmes had a positive impact on education, the level improved and many young Bangladeshis went to university. The programme started with 20 graduates and carried out apprenticeships. Ten years later, beneficiaries are junior managers.



The Swedish National Agency for Higher Vocational Education has been given a national responsibility for the validation of foreign professional qualifications. In Sweden, many employers lack adequate knowledge with regard to the comparability of foreign educational qualification and work experience particularly if such qualifications are acquired outside EU/EEA countries. A speedy and efficient assessment of foreign credentials can improve the individual's prospects in the labour market by clarifying possible needs for supplementary skills and making it easier for employers to evaluate the work experience of the newly arrived immigrant. With the help of validation the individual can realise if and how his/her skills should be complemented as well as make a rational selection of relevant supplementary courses to match the demand on the labour market.

Many countries have undertaken reforms to primary education, including language screening and language teaching for children with migrant backgrounds. Envisaged actions by Member States further include: the funding of adult education to activate participation, language courses, facilitating participation in basic vocational training or upper secondary education, programmes for community integration and validating competences and qualifications⁴⁴. The role of social partners and civil society in fostering the development of lifelong learning programmes in line with the needs of the labour market is also very important. Initiatives include assistance in language learning, in training and finding a job, or e-learning platforms.

After a debate on the ways key stakeholders perceive their respective role and the role of others in addressing the lack of education and training and the lack of recognition of ethnic minority skills and qualifications, participants in the workshops highlighted examples of good practices at the micro level in addressing the lack of education and training to improve access to employment, and potential solutions that can be put into place.

⁴⁰ Work-related, competence-based qualifications.

⁴¹ European Commission, Green Paper Migration and Mobility: Challenges and opportunities for EU education systems, 3 July 2008 (COM (2008) 423 final).

⁴² Council of the European Union, Council conclusions on the education of children with a migrant background, 26 November 2009 (14353/09).

⁴³ Council of the European Union, Council conclusions, A strategic framework for European cooperation in education and training ("ET 2020"), May 2009 (OJ 2009/C 119/02).

⁴⁴ Council of the European Union, Joint Employment Report 2008/2009 (7435/09), 11 March 2009.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

39. Define a European strategy to improve retention and attainment of ethnic minorities in upper secondary education, as well as participation in higher education, training and lifelong learning.
40. Encourage Member States to report on how they are responding to increasing diversity within their education systems in the context of the Integrated Guideline for Growth and Jobs No. 24 on adapting education in response to new competences required.
41. Disaggregate the Education and Training Open Method of Coordination's benchmarks and indicators to track rates of racial segregation and social inclusion in the field of education, so that policy can be improved and implemented (Standing Group on Indicators and Benchmarks). Ensure sound coordination mechanisms to review these targets in line with the Employment Guidelines and the Social Inclusion and Social Protection Strategy.
42. Expand the scope of mobility programmes in order to ensure mobility opportunities for migrant and ethnic minority students, young people in vocational training, volunteers, entrepreneurs or trainees.
43. Develop EU standards, targets and operational mechanisms for a speedy and efficient assessment of credentials acquired in third countries, and of informally acquired skills.
44. Strengthen the engagement with social partners to increase their responsibilities, and coordinate this engagement at the EU level.

Recommendations to Member States

45. Enhance investment in training for migrants and ethnic minorities.
46. Make schools and training facilities more accessible to ethnic minorities and improve their quality:
 - Formulate in every Member State specific targets for the participation of ethnic minorities in general and vocational training as well as lifelong learning;
 - Use the support of civil society organisations of ethnic minorities to identify needs and possible solutions;
 - Abolish school segregation for Roma children and abolish any kind of channelling of Roma and other minorities to schools for children with mental disabilities.
47. Make full use of the possibilities of pre-school education to reduce barriers for children from ethnic minorities before entering formal education. There is a general consensus that participation in pre-school education is essential for language development and for social and communication skills, enabling a good preparation for school and fighting the cycle of exclusion from an early age.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

48. Facilitate access to and strengthen vocational training possibilities in areas other than language training. Increase investment in these other areas of training.
49. Promote a transparent mechanism for the assessment, certification and recognition of skills, including prior learning and previous experience, irrespective of the countries where they were acquired and whether they were acquired formally or informally.
50. Link training activities with concrete opportunities for participation in all areas of life, in employment but also beyond. Language training should stop being seen only as selection criteria for the purpose of integration tests. Develop coaching programmes for participation in the labour as a follow up to trainings.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

51. Develop integrated programmes, providing a combination of skills audit, language courses, educational/vocational training, and on-the-job training.

Progression and well-being in the workplace

Summary of the introductory panel and plenary discussion

Catelene Passchier, Confederal Secretary of the European Trade Union Confederation (ETUC), emphasised that equality was at the heart of democratic society and that social partners have a specific responsibility in this area. The four aspects of equality as defined by the European Commission - rights, respect, recognition, and representation - are very important. According to her, equality legislation is not sufficient. The causes of discrimination need to be understood and analysed. Social inclusion policies are also needed. ETUC therefore tries to influence EU policies, not just on equality but also on social inclusion and protection and migration policies. ETUC also cooperates with other organisations and employers and carries out internal work on how to adapt the trade union movement to the 21st century so that it becomes diverse and modern. She pointed out that the representation of ethnic minorities in trade unions was a big challenge. One of ETUC's priorities is to address the increase in racism, xenophobia, religious intolerance and the rise of the far right. ETUC has the difficult responsibility of protecting migrant workers and ethnic minority workers but also to protect other white workers in times of economic crisis. She believes that the fight against racism and xenophobia should be higher on the agenda and that the sense of urgency is missing on both the employee's and the employers' side. Furthermore, according to her, a new underclass is developing in Europe - e.g. undocumented migrants with no protection at all. While everybody should be equal before the law, social policies to ensure equal opportunities are also needed.

Jean-Louis Carvès, Workforce Diversity Programme Manager at IBM France, highlighted some key points for the promotion of the respect of diversity in the workplace. He emphasised the need to set the rules in companies for ownership and responsibility on diversity at all levels. Employees have to sign a code of ethics, including non-discrimination, and engagement is needed from the top, as well as from the base. Performance assessment is another essential part of diversity policies. The importance of education and training at all management levels was also pointed out, and reverse mentoring⁴⁵ was mentioned as a good practice. Cultural adaptability was viewed as a key success factor. Mr. Carvès also insisted on the need for ethnicity data and a consistent approach in order to enable benchmarking in the evaluation and monitoring process. He mentioned several initiatives for communities reach out, such as the creation of diversity network groups where people from diverse backgrounds exchange on attitudes in the company, or the project Bridge-IT, tackling integration of migrants in

civil society and labour market through ICTs. Social media (IBM Facebook group, blogs, etc.) can also be a powerful tool for the promotion of ethnic and religious diversity within the company. IBM is also using its supplier programme to ensure diversity among suppliers, as the latter have to sign an ethics commitment and audits are conducted to ensure commitments are implemented in practice. Asked about cooperation with trade unions, Mr. Carvès responded that social dialogue varies from country to country, but relations are generally good. Ethnic pay gap monitoring is done where possible (e.g. in the UK).

Martina Ni Cheallaigh, from the European Commission, presented the role of the EU's lifelong learning programmes in fostering innovative approaches for better employability of migrants and ethnic minorities. She recognised that the Commission's Directorate General for Education and Culture was lagging behind in policies targeting migrants and ethnic minorities. While lifelong learning was an important component of the 10-year programme on education and training 2010, the Commission is only starting to look at specific target groups and aspects within this policy. She explained that adult education was a new policy in the Commission, and that its Action plan on adult education prioritises work on disadvantaged groups and people with low levels of skills and qualifications, including minorities and migrants. She also pointed out that new systems were being developed for the validation of foreign qualifications. Most EU Member States insisted that mastering the national language(s) is fundamental to successful integration and plays an active role in society, but different mother tongues and other languages spoken at home and in local and neighbouring environments should be valued more highly (untapped resources). The lifelong learning programmes Grundtvig and Leonardo Da Vinci on Adult education have specific priorities for disadvantaged groups. Various types of projects are funded involving many different stakeholders.

During this session, a "world cafe" approach was followed which aimed to provide a forum for discussion, debate and exchange of ideas and good practices concerning ethnic minority progression and well-being in the workplace. The intention was to determine approaches to improve progression, retention, development and well-being, to draw out good practices and lessons learned from different stakeholders that could have general applicability, and to establish a series of recommendations for action at macro and micro levels.

⁴⁵ Reverse mentoring is where a junior or less senior employee mentors a senior employee to help him get insight into new areas, such as improving their cultural intelligence.

Progression and well-being in the workplace

1. Tackling stereotypes, prejudice and negative attitudes in the public and private sector; the accommodation of diversity in the workplace

Public policies designed to combat inequalities in the labour market can be effective only if they are proactively complemented by initiatives promoted by employers and trade unions and aiming to enhance well being in the workplace. Public services and agencies must seek to ensure cohesion in a society whose members have very different needs, by carefully tailoring their services to the special aspirations and requirements of different groups.



The Swedish government has announced that one of its aims is to increase ethnic and cultural diversity among state employees at all levels. Since October 1999 all government agencies are assigned to work out action plans to promote ethnic and cultural diversity among their employees. Among the support activities, complementary courses are available in three universities for immigrants who wish to work in public administration. The aim of these complementary courses is to enhance the employability and progression of immigrants with foreign university education for a qualified administrative career. The available statistics for the national government sector show a steady rise in the proportion of state employees with a different ethnic background in all skill categories and at all levels.

Beyond the ethical dimension and the need to meet regulatory standards with regard to equality, numerous companies now recognise that workforce diversity can produce a range of business benefits. Moreover, diversity is as relevant for SMEs as it is for large companies, even though only a minority of SMEs may have established formal human resources strategies that have the power to fully harness diversity.



Flexibility in the workplace around religious ceremonies or holiday arrangements was generally described as good practice. There was evidence that with improved flexibility, productivity goes up. It is important for employees to feel that they have a place and are valued for who they are.

In this context organisations, whether they belong to the private or public sector, are led to develop policies and practices that contribute to an overall culture where diversity is welcomed and respected. In particular organisations are led to increasingly encourage practices such as:



The L'OREAL manager evaluation system includes the "leading with sensitivity" skill with criteria linked to the promotion of diversity and the fight against discrimination. Managers are thus evaluated on the basis of their attitudes, behaviour and actions to promote diversity:

- Act with respect according to the L'OREAL Code of Ethics, by adapting behaviour to respect different personalities and cultures, listening and interacting with equal respect at all levels;
- Ensure the development of employees by integrating every new employee, undertaking fair appraisals and building career development plans;
- Develop teams by attracting and recruiting the best talents, seeking diversity, motivating the team to collaborate with different personalities and cultures, mobilising and empowering the team to have different visions.

- Promoting visible statements/images that demonstrate commitment to diversity.
- Ensuring that social events and other structures reflect the diversity of the organisation and broader society.
- Delivering regular awareness training to all employees.
- Providing reasonable accommodation of diversity notably by providing flexible working practices and arrangements.
- Development and training initiatives targeted at ethnic minority employees.

The discussion focused on presenting, identifying, developing and capturing innovative, practical, impactful, tested, and transferable solutions to tackle stereotypes, prejudice and negative attitudes to enhance progression and well-being in the workplace.



SODEXO has sought to overcome stereotypes and biases through a number of interventions including for example: the "Spirit of Inclusion" training course, directed at all its managers, which aims at raising awareness of diversity issues among participants and strives to challenge their ways of thinking; Micro-inequities was the topic of an interactive theatre session viewed by 500 employees that explained how micro-inequities and micro-messages work and how damaging they can be; and in Sweden SODEXO has developed a uniform which includes a headscarf to enable Muslim women who choose to wear it to do so without compromising hygiene regulations or standing out.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

52. Support the development of training tools to promote a discrimination-free workplace.

Recommendations to Member States

53. Ensure that talented migrants and ethnic minorities progress in the public sector and encourage the development of positive duty measures and targets to that end.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

54. Conclude collective agreements aimed at preventing discrimination and promoting diversity in the workplace.
55. Foster a spirit of inclusion by organising interactive activities with various stakeholders, including NGOs, in order to encourage a better accommodation of diversity and facilitate exchanges.
56. Ensure general good and fair management practices, including: clear rules and policies on acceptable behaviours; transparent and inclusive promotion and appraisal processes; and equal access to learning, development, and job opportunities.
57. Recognise, assess and address the unconscious bias that all management and staff have, through the use of various tools and training sessions.
58. Undertake a diversity skills and qualities audit (languages, countries visited, etc.). This exercise is useful to monitor diversity, to construct a positive narrative on diversity within the organisation, and to support management in leveraging the valued added that ethnic minority staff bring to the organisation.

Progression and well-being in the workplace

2. Enhancing progression and well-being of ethnic minorities in the workplace through equality plans and monitoring



ADECCO Group has introduced a range of policies and training programmes on implementing equal treatment in HR processes and procedures including job description, advertisements, selection, evaluation, presentation, contracts, performance appraisals, access to training and development, and promotion. These make particular use of skills-related and competence-based HR frameworks. Adecco Group acknowledges that overcoming implicit bias is a key factor in promoting and implementing diversity and non-discrimination policies. It is part of its "How to face Discrimination" training programme.

Positive attitudes towards ethnic diversity in employment are a strong lever for overcoming discrimination and achieving a more inclusive labour market. This "mindset" requires organisational change and the development of sound policies that will reflect and shape the overall culture and values of an organisation.

The details of an equality strategy for any employer or organisation will vary according to the characteristics of the organisation and the needs of staff and stakeholders. A body of good practice has emerged which provides a framework for discussing the possibilities for action. If an organisation or business is prepared to take equality and diversity seriously, it will ensure that there are appropriate structures and policies in place to provide a framework for this action, and that this gets translated into good practices on the ground. An equality policy is a statement of commitment, identifying areas of activity to be developed to prevent discrimination and promote equality.



IBM cultural diversity reverse mentoring in the Netherlands - Reverse mentoring is where a junior or less senior employee mentors a senior employee to help him get insight into new areas, such as improving their cultural "intelligence". In June 2009, IBM launched such a programme in the Netherlands in order to increase management awareness of diverse employee resources and of the challenges that cultural diverse groups may face in the job market. It also aimed to encourage the mentee to become a better change agent in the organisation and to help him/her initiate concrete actions favouring the inclusion of all and, specifically, lowering the barriers to advancement of employees of diverse cultural backgrounds.

Diversity policies normally cover activities undertaken within an organisation, although they can also contain elements relating to external actions, such as community initiatives. The policy should address issues such as:

- Vision of the organisation as a diverse workplace;
- Commitments to accommodating diversity;
- Purpose of the policy;
- The legal and societal context for the policy, including employees' rights;
- Specific areas where action will be taken, including recruitment, procurement, service contracts, etc;
- Structures to monitor the implementation of the policy;
- Commitment to review the policy as appropriate.



Since the end of 2006, L'OREAL is implementing a specific diversity training programme which is being rolled-out to 8,000 managers in Europe. This training aims to involve, give responsibility to and help managers in implementing the Group's diversity policy by:

- Clarifying the diversity concept and issues for L'OREAL;
 - Helping participants identify barriers on a personal and organisational level;
 - Providing participants with tools to develop an action plan.
- The training, compulsory for all managers, is based on theory (definitions, legal context) and uses situational approaches (case studies, role playing). Some case studies are based on issues experienced by ethnic minorities. At the end of 2009, 6,200 managers (78% of the final target) had been trained in Europe and L'OREAL is planning to extend this training to all employees.*

Several participants highlighted the difficulty to monitor the success of equality policies without having any figures or measures. Diversity training is useful, but not sufficient. Facts and figures would also be powerful tools. This problem is well known in France, where big companies are in favour of ethnic monitoring. However, there is resistance from the anti-racist civil society. Helene Xuan, from the French Commission for diversity and equal opportunities, pointed out that a report will be published shortly in France on ways to develop appropriate tools to measure discrimination and monitor progress within a secure legal framework. The report intends to set the legal framework and indicators. On the contrary, in the UK, resistance to ethnic monitoring comes from the private sector.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

59. Include the monitoring of the progression and well-being of ethnic minorities and vulnerable groups in the workplace within the EU employment guidelines.
60. Encourage Member States to develop Diversity Charters as a first step to develop standards and practices to ensure well being in the workplace.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

61. Pursue an approach which simultaneously addresses non-discrimination, equal opportunities and diversity management to achieve real equality:
 - Implement equal treatment in human resources processes and procedures including performance appraisals, access to training and development, promotion;
 - Establish targets for the progression of ethnic minority workers, if monitoring is possible;
 - Ensure that migrant and ethnic minority workers can see clearly how they can progress within an organisation, ensuring the talent pipeline is representative of the workforce community;
 - Raise awareness on diversity among managers (e.g. online toolkit, training).
62. Establish mentoring schemes to help newly recruited employees, especially migrants and ethnic minorities, to integrate and progress in their workplace.

Progression and well-being in the workplace

3. Addressing the issues of quality of employment and precarious jobs

EU Member States and social partners are increasingly becoming aware of the implications of bad working conditions. International labour standards promoted by the International Labour Organisation have recognised that social protection, health and safety policies are essential to ensure that economic development and job creation go hand in hand with respect for workers' rights and social justice.

When it comes to quality of work for ethnic minorities, the general trend shows that ethnic minorities are more likely to be working where they have less access to employment rights and protection. ENAR's 2008 Shadow Report for Ireland⁴⁶ raised the concern that while a code of practice is now in place, there continues to be limited legal protection for domestic workers. Negative experiences of migrants in the workplace not only concern the level of wages. Ethnic origin also seems to matter as regards harassment in the workplace, and to be a major obstacle for career advancement. In Spain only the "latino" minority group experiences upward occupational mobility.



In Northern Ireland, efforts were made towards reinforcing the rights of migrant workers, such as migrant women who are domestic workers, workers from the restaurant industry, or the agriculture sector. The means used were the empowerment of these workers to have a voice and to negotiate through partnerships between trade unions and the domestic workers action group. As a result, a code of practice for rights of domestic workers was adopted. The empowerment dimension is critical to reinforce rights of vulnerable workers.



In the United Kingdom, the TUC's (Trade Union Congress) Commission on Vulnerable Employment published a report exposing a hidden Britain. It shows that employment practices condemned as exploitative in the nineteenth century are still common today. The study gives as examples the case of construction workers who had been injured at work but were not entitled to welfare protection or sick pay because of their contractual and immigration status, or of office cleaners on casual contracts who had no choice but to keep working when they were ill, as they could neither afford to lose a day's pay nor risk the sack. It reveals that vulnerable work is not inevitable, and that women, people from black and ethnic minority groups as well as disabled people are more likely to suffer from its consequences.

The ILO 1998 Declaration on fundamental principles and rights at work considers equality, non-discrimination and social dialogue as the foundations for decent work. The main challenge is how to ensure effective labour law protection for all workers regardless of their employment status. Good practices include awareness raising of rights at work, providing better opportunities to progress from low-paid and insecure jobs, and assisting vulnerable workers.

Participants in the workshop felt the biggest issues were insecurity, working conditions, the lack of progression perspectives and an extreme imbalance of power between employers and employees. An efficient policy for the recognition of qualifications, whether acquired formally or informally, was essential to enable migrants and minorities to progress in the workplace towards quality jobs. Priority areas for further development were the revision of legislation and the dissemination of information on rights.

⁴⁶ ENAR Shadow Report 2008, Ireland.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

63. Revise the EU Directive providing for sanctions against employers of illegally staying third-country nationals, and create secure spaces for undocumented workers to report rights abuses to relevant authorities.

Recommendations to Member States

64. Provide information to migrant and ethnic minority workers on their human rights and obligations and assist them with defending their rights.
65. Support community NGOs to spread information on employees' rights and to empower migrant workers to have a voice and defend their rights.
66. Adopt measures to ensure, in law and in practice, that all migrant and ethnic minority workers benefit from equality of treatment regarding safety and health protection, including measures to address the specific risks in certain occupations and sectors, particularly agriculture, construction, mines, hotels and restaurants, domestic work, and to address the specific risks faced by women.
67. Reinforce and strengthen labour inspection measures in all workplaces where migrants and ethnic minorities are employed, in order to effectively monitor their working conditions.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

68. Co-operate with a view to encouraging the participation of migrants and persons of immigrant background in trade unions and other workplace representative structures.

Progression and well-being in the workplace

4. Addressing the lack of education and language skills



SODEXO offers training in native language to migrant employees. In the UK and Ireland some of the training commonly followed by new SODEXO employees is offered in Polish, in order to support the integration of members of the large and growing Polish workforce.

It is recognised that lifelong learning and vocational training are crucial strategies necessary to the upgrading of skills and critical in helping individuals harness their potential in the workplace. While training and induction should be provided to all staff, positive action and targeted initiatives should ensure that ethnic minority communities integrate successfully into their new working environment and are given the necessary support for personal growth.



A project in the region of Veneto focused on the demand for training, managing a more diverse work force, developing a learning culture in the workplace and human resource planning. The development of new training methods and tools adapted to the needs of immigrant workers, employers and training organisations represented the main thrust of the project⁴⁷.

Ensuring regular and continued access to education and training facilities is essential to ensure that ethnic minorities are offered the possibility to realise their full potential in progressing in the workplace.



The bus company Arriva in Denmark set up a training school in 2007 to teach its bus drivers to communicate in the Danish language; 50% of the company's workforce consisted of bus drivers from a minority background. The company also started a mentoring scheme whereby an experienced driver from the same cultural background could assist a new person in the daily accomplishment of their job.⁴⁸

Under the European Social Fund, the EQUAL programme (2000-2006) has supported the development of innovative practices aimed at promoting the integration of migrants through lifelong learning.

Participants in this workshop identified improving access to lifelong learning for ethnic minorities as a priority and discussed what transferable and innovative solutions could be developed.

⁴⁷ G.Local-Immigrazione, Competenze, Sviluppo Nei Sistemi Territoriali, <https://webgate.ec.europa.eu/equal/jsp/dpComplete.jsp?cip=IT&national=IT-G-VEN-008>.

⁴⁸ ENAR Shadow Report 2008, Denmark.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions and Member States

69. Support initiatives ensuring regular and continued access to education and training facilities, as an essential tool to enable ethnic minorities to realise their full potential in progressing in the workplace.
70. Provide guidance and standards to Member States on how to integrate equal opportunities and diversity management in the implementation of different EU-financed programmes, particularly when using Lifelong Learning Programme funding.
71. Develop public-private partnerships for funding programmes in the area of education and training.
72. Develop specific training and apprenticeship schemes as mechanisms to ensure the link between education and the workplace environment, and facilitate the training and progression of ethnic minorities and migrants.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

73. Enable migrants and ethnic minorities to find employment corresponding to their qualifications:
 - Establish a system for testing employees' skills with a view to offering them adequate professional training, requalification and vocational guidance;
 - Provide career planning schemes to migrants who might be underqualified but would be willing to progress in their workplace.
74. Ensure that migrants and ethnic minorities have equal access to opportunities for promotion through the provision of training programmes.
75. Ensure that training programmes accommodate diversity and the socio-cultural specificities of minorities.
76. Underline the role of trade unions in negotiating equality and training plans with companies.

PART 3

Partnership building: Exploring methods of identifying common areas of concern and strengthening links between key stakeholders

The objective of this last session was to provide a forum for discussion, debate and exchange of ideas and good practices concerning partnership building across different stakeholders involved in promoting equality in employment for ethnic minorities. The intention was to:

- Identify common areas of concern, overlapping initiatives, practices and approaches to promote equality in employment;
- Explore methods and approaches to partnership working across the different stakeholders, drawing out good practices and lessons learned that could have general applicability;
- Strengthen links between the key stakeholders present;
- Establish a series of recommendations and actions that can be followed through after the event at a macro and micro level.



Conceptual introduction and summary of discussions

Conceptual introduction and summary of discussions

Addressing the barriers which prevent ethnic minorities from fully participating in the labour market often requires a transversal and multifaceted approach. Tackling the issue of equality and employment requires coordinated actions involving a range of stakeholders from the public sector, the private sector, the trade unions and civil society alike. A multiple stakeholders approach is therefore particularly needed to ensure that equality in employment can be acted upon, building on a combination of policy tools and practices at micro and macro levels. The European Union Structural Funds guidelines and activities have confirmed the need for multi-level approaches and partnerships in tackling the issues linked to labour market inclusion globally. The experience of the European Social Fund (ESF) shows that the issues of employment, social inclusion and equality are multifaceted and complex matters that need to be addressed from various perspectives and angles. A multiple stakeholder's partnership approach can play a catalyst role in sharing knowledge, complementing specific approaches and practices and creating innovative social capital.



In 2007 and 2008 the Swedish government conducted a dialogue with NGOs regarding the relationship between the state and the voluntary sector in the social sphere. The aim was to recognise the important role NGOs play in shaping public opinion, as interest organisations and providers of social services; to encourage NGOs to contribute to the development of the relationship between the state and the voluntary sector as well as to contribute to the sector's independence and autonomy; and to recognise the important role NGOs play in the integration process, especially regarding the integration of new arrivals.

Unfortunately, only a few Member States have put in place permanent structures specifically for dialogue with civil society and social partners on equality issues. While some projects involve public and private actors, or NGOs and social partners, cooperation in this field needs to be improved. Helene Xuan, from the French Commission for diversity and equal opportunities, said the Commission was working in



partnership with companies on several major projects, such as anonymous CVs or the diversity ISO label.

The EU programmes' methodology for partnership includes promoting the networking of stakeholders in the field of employment and labour market inclusiveness; and encouraging the inclusion of social partners and NGOs in ESF projects. Thomas Bender, in charge of the ESF coordination at the European Commission, explained that many projects undertaken under EQUAL did not show lasting effects. The Commission is therefore trying to mainstream the lessons learned from EQUAL in the ESF and to integrate the structures that have dealt with EQUAL in ESF structures. The main difficulty is to link programming with policy development. While the European Commission has noticed a lot of will for innovative projects and programmes, there is no real enthusiasm to mainstream lessons learned from these projects in public policies. Even at the Commission level, links between the EQUAL and ESF geographical desks have not been strong enough to ensure mainstreaming. Links with the debates in the social OMC also need to be improved. The situation is often similar in Member States, where ESF managing authorities have been put in place to deal with transnational partnership issues, but with weak links with the national policy making. The Commission is sometimes criticised for not doing enough, and some participants highlighted that the added value of working in partnership required more visibility and recognition.

Conceptual introduction and summary of discussions

The discussion in plenary focused on the different perspectives of the stakeholders on the outcome expected from working in partnership.

Companies perceive the work on diversity as an investment to improve the performance of the company and social cohesion. Developing partnerships with civil society is useful to raise awareness, develop the right discourse for different environments/countries and find the right actions.

Conversely, NGOs adopt a rights and values based approach. However, these different approaches are not mutually exclusive. NGOs could make a contribution to the business case by bringing the values based approach into the debate. One challenge is to find ways to help SMEs with the business case, as diversity might be too big an investment for them. L'Oreal pointed out that big companies can involve their SME suppliers in the diversity journey.



Several survey respondents cited the ACCEDER project in Spain as an example of good practice in partnership building. Involving partnership working between EU Structural Funds, national policies, civil society entities and local employers, the close links in the programme between beneficiaries, administrations and enterprises, the focus on the fight against discrimination of most vulnerable groups and the setting up of professional and committed teams underpin the success of ACCEDER. All stakeholders have a mutual interest in the programme and have benefited from it, to the point that it has now become self-sustaining.

The trade unions started to work on diversity in response to the need to represent an increasingly diverse workforce. They have not always felt concerned about diversity;

the push came from women/black workers. From the trade unions perspective, working with NGOs and local communities is crucial to understand the challenges faced.



Natasa Sukic, from the Association Skuc in Slovenia, presented a successful example of partnership between social partners and civil society, the European Commission funded project "Diversity Management in Employment". In this project, joint seminars were organised for trade unions and companies, and a single training manual was produced for the different stakeholders.

From a public employers' perspective, diversity is part of general human resources policy, to fulfil the needs of all customers and represent the people they deal with. At a time of skills shortage, the public sector needs to set an example to private companies.

NGOs have an obvious interest in cooperating with social partners and the private sector because these actors have the power to implement diversity. The objective is to ensure a safe workplace for everyone without fear of discrimination. To ensure measures to this end are put in place, it is important to work in partnership with companies. NGOs have an interest in finding good practices from the private sector for advocacy purposes.

In order to convince companies at the national level to get involved in partnerships, participants suggested the organisation of meetings and debates by public authorities and other stakeholders (e.g. chambers of commerce). At the EU level, institutions can encourage and support dialogue on the issue through the social OMC. Building sustainable partnerships requires a common understanding on priority issues as well as sustainable funding.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to EU institutions

77. Support the dissemination of outcomes and lessons learned from successful projects carried out with the support of the ESF and the Community initiative EQUAL.
78. Ensure the sustainability of ESF and EQUAL projects by providing mainstream funding, and embedding lessons from EQUAL in future programmes.
79. Improve linkages and connections between funding programmes and the employment, social and education OMCs governing mechanisms.
80. Set up a European multi-stakeholder permanent forum gathering civil society, companies and social partners to promote the exchange of good practices in employment and equality.

Recommendations to Member States

81. Improve linkages between funding authorities and policy making in the employment and social sectors. In particular, systematic connections should be established between the authorities managing the European Social Fund and policy makers at national level.
82. Ensure that organisations of ethnic minorities and NGOs representing and defending the rights of ethnic minorities are systematically involved whenever inclusion policies, including employment schemes (as they affect them), are drawn up.
83. Support the networking and cooperation of public authorities, civil society, businesses and trade unions in order to develop inclusion strategies at local/ company level which are transferable.

Recommendations to public and private employers and social partners

84. Invite social partners at European level to update their Joint Declaration on the prevention of racial discrimination and xenophobia and promotion of equal treatment in the workplace adopted in Florence in 1995 and encourage them to elaborate, in the context of their joint work programme initiatives, labour market inclusion of ethnic minorities.
85. Set up multi-stakeholder working groups at national level to define common objectives and understanding, to discuss national policies and develop strategies to monitor and develop non-discrimination rights.
86. Stimulate interactions between companies' volunteering programmes and the neighbouring ethnic minority community environment.
87. Systematically involve the target groups as partners in projects affecting them.

CONCLUDING REMARKS

Aurelio Fernandez, Chair of the EU's Social Protection Committee, pointed out that having a job remains the main safeguard against social exclusion. Unfortunately, no improvement has been noticed in reaching those furthest from the labour market, and jobs do not necessarily put people out of poverty. "Support services" are needed, including social services, to reach more people furthest from the labour market. He pointed out that precarious employment and involuntary part time work has increased in the EU. Low skilled migrant women are particularly affected by the increase in precarious employment. He insisted that responses to the crisis must be carefully thought through as very useful social programmes have been affected by decisions on budget cuts. With regard to the European Commission's Europe 2020 consultation paper, Mr Fernandez welcomed the focus on education, including greater emphasis on vulnerable groups. He regretted however that discrimination was not mentioned at all in the paper. Participants hoped that the new strategy would adopt an integrated approach, with an emphasis on the interdependence of policies.

Having agreed on 87 practical recommendations, and 4 key recommendations to the EU institutions, Member States, the private sector and social partners, participants of the Ad Hoc Expert Group expressed their commitment to promote these recommendations and monitor their implementation. ENAR and its partners are looking forward to assessing and reporting on progress towards the achievement of these recommendations by the year 2015. In the meantime, the process of mutual learning between the different stakeholders will continue, with an in-depth reflection on key priority areas conducted through a series of seminars.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

I. Sign up to and implement good practice diversity standards across all areas of the workforce, the workplace, customer and supplier activities in the public and private sector alike

- a) Provide funding for the implementation of diversity taskforces in the workplace, including training and awareness raising activities on non-discrimination, equality and diversity management.
- b) Use role models at the top level management to promote the message of non-discrimination and fighting stereotypes.
- c) Develop mentoring programmes to facilitate contacts between employers and migrants and ethnic minorities seeking employment, and to help newly recruited employees, especially migrants and ethnic minorities, to integrate in their workplace.
- d) Use public procurement and corporate supplier policies to support ethnic minority businesses and to encourage employers to implement high standards of diversity practices.

II. Mobilise and encourage cooperation between all relevant stakeholders to enhance equality in employment for ethnic and religious minorities, including migrants

- a) Set up a European multi-stakeholder permanent forum gathering civil society, companies and social partners to promote the exchange of good practices in employment and equality.
- b) Invite social partners at European level to update their Joint Declaration on the prevention of racial discrimination and xenophobia and promotion of equal treatment at the workplace adopted in Florence in 1995 and encourage them to elaborate, in the context of their joint work programme initiatives, labour market inclusion of ethnic minorities.
- c) Invite Member States to set up multi-stakeholder working groups including civil society, businesses and social partners at national level to discuss national policies and develop strategies to monitor and develop equality in employment in practice.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

III. Provide the necessary policy and legislative tools for promoting equality in employment at the national and EU levels

- a) Ensure that the objective of equality for ethnic and religious minorities is mainstreamed in all relevant policies of the EU and its member states, including employment, health, housing and education. This requires integrating race equality into all Community and member states policies and activities, and into every stage of policy processes - design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation - with a view to promoting equality between minority and majority populations. It means assessing how policies impact on the life and position of ethnic and religious minorities and taking responsibility to re-address them if necessary.
- b) Give new political impetus to the issues of equality in employment for ethnic and religious minorities and non-discrimination:
 - Adopt the proposal for a Council Directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation⁴⁹.
 - Urge Member States to make full use of the provisions of the transposed legislation on non-discrimination in the area of employment (EU Directive 2000/78), including the promotion of positive action mechanisms in recruitment policies.
- c) Combat abuse and exploitation of migrants by guaranteeing full protection of their rights:
 - Ensure the ratification by the EU and its Member States of the United Nations Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, a vital tool to combat abuse and exploitation of migrants.
 - Adopt the proposed Framework Directive on the basic socio-economic rights of all third country workers⁵⁰.

⁴⁹ European Commission, proposal for a Council Directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation . COM/2008/0426 final, 2 July 2008.

⁵⁰ European Commission, proposal for a Council Directive on a single application procedure for a single permit for third country nationals to reside and work in the territory of a Member State and on a common set of rights for third country workers legally residing in a Member State, 2007.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

- Revise the EU Directive providing for sanctions against employers of illegally staying third-country nationals, and create secure spaces for undocumented workers to report rights abuses to relevant authorities.
- d) Promote and adopt a transparent mechanism for the assessment, certification and recognition of skills, including prior learning and previous experience, irrespective of the countries where they were acquired and whether they were acquired formally or informally.

IV. Ensure the adoption of a future Europe 2020 strategy based on fundamental rights, with a strong social pillar that effectively improves employment for ethnic and religious minorities

- a) Look into the specific barriers migrants and ethnic minorities face and develop strategies to overcome them in the future EU integrated guidelines on employment.
- b) Convince Member States of the value of being fully involved in the Open Methods of Coordination⁵¹ (OMC) and of using data collection, indicators and benchmarking:
 - Overcome reluctance to collect data on ethnicity by encouraging data collection on a strictly anonymous, voluntary and self-defining basis, in compliance with the rules on the protection of personal data, to bring more insight to diversity policies and management systems and increase the impact of good diversity practices.
 - Disaggregate relevant indicators on grounds relating to migration or ethnic background.
 - Report on the progress of each specific minority group to the EU and set national targets for the participation of ethnic minorities in the labour market for Member States that collect disaggregated data.
- c) Make full use of existing instruments such as the annual Labour Force Survey and the EU-SILC⁵² to examine the situation of newcomers, long-term residents, naturalised migrants and the children of migrants.

⁵¹ On social inclusion, employment, and education.

⁵² The annual Labour Force Survey and the EU-SILC are instruments compiling comparable indicators on social cohesion for policy monitoring at EU level in the framework of the Open Method of Coordination.

ANNEX 1

List of participants

NAME	ORGANISATION	COUNTRY
Abdul Aziz Mohammed	Faithwise	UK
Akif Silvia	SELOR	Belgium
Balustre D'Erneville Sylviane	L'Oreal	France
Beauvois Baudile / Amalyne	ENAR	Belgium
Bender Thomas	European Commission	Belgium
Bock Julia	Bundesagentur für Arbeit	Germany
Calacean Gelu	European Commission	Belgium
Campayne Paul	Diversity Practice	UK
Carves Jean Louis	IBM	France
Charhon Pascale	ENAR	Belgium
Cilento Marco	ETUC	Belgium
De Sancho Irina	ETUC	Belgium
Fernandez Aurelio	EU Social Protection Committee	Spain
Fresno Juan Manuel	Independent Expert on Roma issues	Spain
Görg Andreas	ENAR Austria	Austria
Hagos Michael	Ministry for Integration & Gender Equality	Sweden
Hildebert Pascal	ENAR	Belgium
Holthuis Egbert	European Commission	Belgium
Isal Sarah	Runnymede Trust	UK
Ivanov Ivan	ERIO	Belgium
Kammerer Sophie	ENAR	Belgium
Kin - Armbrust Celina	ENAR	Belgium
King Brenda	EESC	Belgium
King Sarah	TUC	Belgium
Lopes Carlos-Alberto	European Commission	Belgium
Lubin Kadima	Commissariat diversité et égalité des chances	France
Monnot Jean Michel	SODEXO	France
Ni Cheallaigh Martina	European Commission	Belgium
Niessen Jan	Migration Policy Group	Belgium
O'Donogue Siobhan	Migrants Rights Centre	Ireland
Onyeji Chibo	ENAR	Austria
Ott Joachim	European Commission	Belgium
Passchier Catelene	ETUC	Belgium
Polykarpou Doros	KISA	Cyprus
Privot Michael	ENAR	Belgium
Roch Bruce	Adecco Group France	France
Scammell Geoff	Labour Market Inclusion	UK
Siklossy Georgina	ENAR	Belgium
Sukic Natasa	SKUC	Slovenia
Urmos Andor	Ministry of Social Affairs	Hungary
Wahlgren Juliana	ENAR	Belgium
Xuan Helene	Commissariat diversité et égalité des chances	France

ANNEX 2

Meeting programme

Thursday 26 November 2009

9.00 - 9.30 Registration of participants

9.30 - 10.00

Welcoming remarks, introduction and opening of the Ad Hoc Expert Group Meeting

Chibo Onyeji, Vice-Chair of ENAR
Brenda King, Member of the EESC

10.00 - 10.15

Defining the objectives and methodology of the seminar

Paul Campayne, facilitator of the ad hoc expert group

10.15 - 11.15

Part 1: The situation of ethnic minorities in the labour market

- Target group and state of play, the barriers affecting ethnic minorities: findings of the EU's High Level Advisory Group - *Joachim Ott, Policy Officer, European Commission, Action against Discrimination, Civil Society*
- The specific situation of the Roma - *Jose Manuel Fresno, Independent Expert on Roma issues, Spain*
- Improving data collection and defining common indicators: what are the challenges? - *Jan Niessen, Director of Migration Policy Group (MPG), Belgium*
- The inclusion of ethnic minorities in the employment dimension of the Lisbon strategy: Lessons learned and ways forward - *Egbert Hohthuis, European Commission, Deputy Head of Unit, European Employment Strategy, CSR, Local Development*

Chair: Paul Campayne, facilitator of the ad hoc expert group

----- Coffee -----

11.30 - 13.15

Part 2: Access to the labour market

Introductory panel (11:30-12:00)

- Strategies to improve migrants access to the labour market in Sweden - *Michael Hagos, Ministry for Integration and Gender Equality, Sweden*
- Strategies to improve the Roma's access to employment - *Andor Urnos, Head of Department of Roma Integration, Ministry of social affairs, Hungary*
- The business case for diversity/standards for recruitment policies - *Bruce Roch, Director Innovation & Diversity, Adecco Group, France*

Chair: Sarah Isal, Deputy Director, Runnymede Trust, UKREN

Parallel workshops (12:00-13:15)

- Workshop 1:** Tackling stereotypes, prejudice and negative attitudes, preventing discrimination in recruitment
Facilitator: *Bruce Roch, Director, Innovation & Diversity, Adecco Group, France - Rapporteur: Pascale Charhon, ENAR*

- Workshop 2:** Integration strategies, including supporting mobility and preventing the establishment of segregated neighbourhoods
Facilitator: *Ivan Ivanov, Director, ERIO, ENAR member - Rapporteur: Michael Privat, ENAR*

- Workshop 3:** Enhancing access to "quality jobs"
Facilitator: *Andreas Goerg, ENAR member, Austria - Rapporteur: Celina Kin-Armbrust, ENAR*

- Workshop 4:** Addressing the lack of education and training, improving language skills, and addressing the lack of recognition of skills and qualifications
Facilitator: *Jose Manuel Fresno, Independent Expert on Roma issues, Spain - Discussant: The EU's Lisbon strategy on education and training: What can be done for better employability of migrants and ethnic minorities?*
Gelu Calacean, Policy Officer, European Commission, School Education, Comenius - Rapporteur: Georgina Siklosy, ENAR

----- Lunch -----

14.15 - 14.45

Plenary session on access to the labour market: presenting the results of the workshops

14.45 - 16.45

Part 3: Progression and well being in the work place

Introductory panel (14.45-15.30)

- How can the issue of progression and well being of ethnic minorities be better addressed by social partners?
- *Caterine Pausscher, Confederal Secretary of ETUC*

- Promoting the respect of diversity in the work place - *Jean-Louis Canvés, Workforce Diversity Programme Manager, France, Cultural Diversity Programme Leader, Europe, IBM*
- The role of the EU's Lifelong learning programmes in fostering innovative approaches for better employability of migrants and ethnic minorities - *Martina Ni Cheallaigh, Policy Officer, European Commission, Adult Education, Grundtvig*

Chair: Pascale Charhon, Director of ENAR

"World cafe" workshops (15:30-16:45)

Introduction to the concept of "World cafe" workshops: *Andreas Goerg, ENAR member, Austria*

- Workshop 1:** Tackling stereotypes, prejudice and negative attitudes in the public and private sector: the accommodation of diversity in the work place
Facilitator: *Sylviane Balastre d'Erneville, Europe Diversity Manager, L'Oréal - Rapporteur: Georgina Siklosy, ENAR*

- Workshop 2:** Enhancing progression and well being of ethnic minorities in the work place through equality plans and monitoring
Facilitator: *Jean-Michel Mornot, Vice-President, Group Diversity & Inclusion, SODEXO - Rapporteur: Celina Kin-Armbrust, ENAR*

- Workshop 3:** Addressing the issues of quality of employment and precarious jobs
Facilitator: *Sarah King, TUC, UK - Rapporteur: Michael Privat, ENAR*

- Workshop 4:** Addressing the lack of education and language skills
Facilitator: *Pascal Hildebert, ENAR - Rapporteur: Pascale Charhon, ENAR*

----- Coffee -----

17.15 - 17.45 Plenary session on progression and well being in the work place: presenting the results of the workshops

- 20:00 Dinner -

Friday 27 November 2009

9.30 - 11.30

Part 4: Partnership building: exploring methods of identifying common areas of concern and strengthening links between key stakeholders

Introductory panel (9:30-10:00)

- The added value of partnership: lessons learned from the ESF and EQUAL projects - *Thomas Bender, Head of Unit, European Commission, ESF coordination*
- The role of partnerships between public authorities and the private sector in combating discrimination in recruitment - *Hélène Aujan, Counsellor, Commissariat à la diversité et à l'égalité des chances, France*
- Partnership in action between Social Partners and Civil Society: the European Commission funded project "Diversity Management in Employment" - *Nalasa Sukic, Project coordinator, Association Skuc, Slovenia*

Chair: Siobhan O'Donoghue, Director, Migrants Rights Centre, ENAR Ireland

Debate in plenary: ensuring sustainable effective partnership between key stakeholders

Chair: Paul Campayne, facilitator of the ad hoc expert group

----- Coffee -----

12.00-13.00

Recommendations and ways forward

Sophie Kammerer, ENAR

Concluding remarks

The EU 2020 strategy: a tool for the promotion of equality in the labour market? - *Aurelio Fernandez, Chair of the EU's Social Protection Committee, Spain*

Chair: Mohammed Aziz, Chair of ENAR

european network against racism aisbl



60 Rue Gallait, 3rd Floor • B-1030 Brussels
Tel: +32-2-229.35.70 • Fax: +32-2-229.35.75
E-mail: info@enar-eu.org

The European Network Against Racism (ENAR) is a network of some 600 organisations working to combat racism in all the EU member states and acts as the voice of the anti-racist movement in Europe. ENAR is determined to fight racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, to promote equality of treatment between European Union citizens and third country nationals, and to link local/regional/national initiatives with European Union initiatives.

Visit ENAR's website: www.enar-eu.org